

The Effect of Unionisation on Employees' Job Satisfaction and Organisational Commitment in the Cape Coast and Takoradi Metropolis of Ghana

Lebbaeus Asamani^{1*} Abigail Opoku Mensah²

1. Department of Educational Foundations, Faculty of Education, University of Cape Coast, Ghana
2. Department of Management Studies, School of Business, University of Cape Coast, Ghana

*Email of Corresponding Author: lebbaeusa@yahoo.com

Abstract

The study sought to find out how being a member of a trade union affects the satisfaction of employees in the Cape Coast and Takoradi Metropolis derive from their jobs and also how it influences their commitment to their organizations. In other words, the study examined whether unionized employees were more satisfied and committed to their organizations than non-unionized employees. The research design employed for the study was the descriptive survey. A total of 400 respondents were sampled from various financial institutions (insurance and banking institutions), using the systematic random sampling procedure. The respondents included 224 unionized employees and 176 non-unionized employees. The instrument used for the study was a set of questionnaire consisting of the Weiss et. al 20-item Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire and Allen and Meyer 18-item organisational commitment scale. The data were analyzed using both descriptive and inferential statistics to answer and test the research questions and hypotheses. The main findings of the study indicate that 87% of the respondents believed that union membership is important. Again, the findings suggest that on the average, unionized employees were more satisfied with their jobs than non-unionized employees, but non-unionized employees were more committed to their organizations than the unionized employees. However, a test of significance indicated that the two groups did not significantly differ in terms of their commitment and job satisfaction. The findings were discussed and appropriate recommendations were made.

Key Words: Unionisation, Job Satisfaction, Organisational commitment, Non-unionised, Ghana

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background to the Study

The term unionization is reflected in the total expression of Ghanaian workers - both from the public and private job sectors. Beginning in the renaissance and continuing into the present day, employees have always found their income to be insufficient (Peter Hart, 2006). Also, as the whole world finds itself in a serious economic turmoil, the pendulum has swung from employers increasing their role to trimming down role towards employees. In order for employees to fight for their right and well deserved income, they resorted to forming trade union as it will be easier for them to bargain as a group than individuals and this is in line with the literally proverbial translated saying "It is more difficult to break a bunch of broom sticks than a single broom stick".

According to Armstrong (1999; 694), trade unions have existed to "redress the balance of power between employers and employees." In other words, unions exist to let management know that they cannot take workers for granted and that there will be, from time to time, alternative views on issues affecting employees. Thus, Trade Unions are voluntary organisations formed by workers to fight for improved economic and work conditions of their members at work.

A union has been defined as "a continuous association of wage earners for the purpose of mainly maintaining or improving the conditions of their working lives" (Webbs, 1920). Dunlop (1984) further elaborated on the efforts of trade unions by citing that they are primarily concerned with industrial jurisprudence – being involved in grievance and arbitration procedures, rules governing promotion, transfers, discipline, dismissals, etc.–and the economic regulation of employment – regulation of salaries, benefits, working hours and terms of the wage–work bargain. Under the Labour Act 651, a trade union means any association of workers, the principal purposes of which are to promote and protect their economic and social interests (Labour Act, 2003).

From all these different definitions, it is evident that the fundamental purpose of a trade union is to offer its members protection and defence from the arbitrary action of management, and the economic system within which they are employed.

Although Unionization in Ghana dated back in 1919, after a successful strike by the country's workers which triggered a series of successful collective actions during which some few permanent organisations were found, and afterwards, other Unions like The Gold and Silver Smith's Association, The Colony and Ashanti Motor Union, The Carpenter and Mason Union were also founded in 1920. Their aims were not fully realised until the constitution of the republic of Ghana was enforced to amend some of the old laws related to trade

unions like the act which prohibits civil servants from joining or organizing a trade union - Industrial Relations Act (IRA) of 1958.

Moreover, Ghana joined the International Labour Organisation in 1957 and immediately the Convention Peoples Party (CPP) Government ratified many of the ILO Conventions including the 'core' Conventions that guarantee workers the right and freedom to form or join unions (Convention No. 87), the right to collective bargaining (Convention No. 98), abolition of forced labour (Conventions Nos. 29 and 105), and equal treatment (Conventions Nos. 100 and 111). Many other ILO Conventions that sought to promote industrial harmony and welfare of workers were also ratified. These included Conventions on hours of work in industry, weekly rest, minimum wage fixing, labour inspection, underground work by women, employment service, night work by women, social policy, working environment, child labour, labour administration, and many others. Ghana ratified 46 ILO Conventions in all but were only fortified after the Constitution of Ghana, 1992, came into force (ILO Decent Work Pilot Programme, Ghana).

The Constitution of Ghana, 1992, came into force on 7th January, 1993. Its Chapter 5 covers "Fundamental Human Rights and Freedoms". Section 12(2) states that "Every person in Ghana, whatever their race, place of origin, political opinion, colour, religion, creed or gender shall be entitled to the fundamental human rights and freedoms of the individual contained in this Chapter, but subject to respect for the rights and freedoms of others and for the public interest". Section 21 sets out general freedoms such as freedom of speech. Section 21(1)(e) guarantees every person the right to work under satisfactory, safe and healthy conditions, and the right to receive equal pay for equal work without distinction of any kind. Workers are further assured of rest, leisure and reasonable limitation of working hours and periods of holidays with pay, as well as remuneration for public holidays. The Constitution also provides for the right of workers to form or join trade union of their choice for the promotion and protection of their economic and social interests; forced labour is prohibited. Thus "Every worker has the right to form or join a trade union of his choice for the promotion and protection of his economic rights and social interests".

There are two national trade union centres in Ghana, the Trades Union Congress of Ghana and the Ghana Federation of Labour. The **Ghana Federation of Labour** (GFL) is a national trade union centre of Ghana, affiliated with the International Trade Union Confederation. The Trades Union Congress (TUC) of the Ghana is the main umbrella organization for trade union activities in Ghana. The membership of other labour organisations outside the TUC family is currently estimated at around 300,000. This means out of an estimated formal sector workforce of 1.2 million about two-third is unionised. This represents just about seven percent of the total labour force in Ghana which is estimated at 12 million.

Ghana TUC offers policy interventions for proper labour market policies, education and knowledge empowerment of its members. Because of the influences of the neo-liberal policies of free market that "promote firing of workers without any reason", there have been cases where employees were dismissed without reasons. In order to curtail the repetition of such occurrences, Ghana Trade Unions have been advocating the ratification of the ILO Convention 158 which provides that an employee's job should not be terminated without reason (TUC Bulletin, 2009:2). Additionally, Ghana Trade Unions have been consistently advocating social dialogue as one of the key pillars of the ILO Decent Work agenda and against steps of employers to use the economic crisis to blackmail workers and governments to accept labour flexibility and wage freezes to weaken labour standards. In 2006, Ghana labour movement played a critical role in ensuring the introduction of a new pension law, passed in 2008 and new Pay Policy which is expected to start in July, 2010. With the new public sector pay reforms, the government intends to put all public sector workers on one salary structure called the Single Spine Salary Structure to address Ghana's salary inequities.

What is more is that, presently the total membership of trade unions in Ghana has over 500,000, which guarantees union members to bargain for better wages, work hours, benefits, workplace health and safety, and other work-related issues. How then, does trade union membership affect job satisfaction and organizational commitment of employees in the various organizations in Ghana?

Job satisfaction could be defined as positive feelings that employees have towards their jobs (Schermerhorn, Hunt and Osborn, 1997:98) or satisfaction and loyalty that employees have towards their jobs (George and Jones, 1996:66-67; Moorhead and Griffin, 1995:64). Job satisfaction is an employee's general attitude towards his job (Robbins, 1986:104) and being served the events and/or elements which an employee attaches importance. Besides individual variables like gender (Vaydonoff, 1980:178; Hulin and Smith 1967), age (Lee and Wilbur, 1985:782), marital status, education and personality (King et al., 1982:120) wage (Borjas, 1979), promotion (Jamal and Baba, 1991), working conditions (Near et al., 1984), job and jobs' characteristics (Robbins, 1991:172) also affect job satisfaction (Blegen, 1993: 37).

According to Meyer et al. (2002), job satisfaction is a determinative of organizational commitment. Based on the multidimensional nature of organizational commitment, there is growing support for a three-

component model proposed by Meyer and Allen (1991). All three components have implications for the continuing participation of the individual in the organization. The three components are:

Affective Commitment: Psychological attachment to organization.

Continuance Commitment: Costs associated with leaving the organization.

Normative Commitment: Perceived obligation to remain with the organization.

The main difference between organizational commitment and job satisfaction is that while organizational commitment can be defined as the emotional responses which an employee has towards his organization; job satisfaction is the responses that an employee has towards any job. It is considered that these two variables are highly interrelated.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

Although a wide variety of studies have been undertaken to explore the nature of the relationship between job satisfaction and employee commitment of trade union member employees as well as non-member employees, Schwochau (1987) still believes that the relationship between union membership and satisfaction and commitment are complex and still not fully understood. Hence, this study is to find out the nature, extent or degree to which unionization affects job satisfaction and employee commitment.

Also in the Ghanaian setting, a few studies or researches have been done in the area of relationship between unionization, employees' job satisfaction and organisational commitment.

1.3 Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to investigate and describe the effect of unionization on employees' job satisfaction and organisational commitment. The study also investigated how age and gender related to job satisfaction and the specific subscales of the Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire (MSQ).

1.4 Research Question/Hypotheses

This study answered one research question and the following 4 hypotheses.

Research question: 1. How do employees perceive unionization in an organisation?

Hypotheses:

H₁: Male and female employees will differ in terms of their Job Satisfaction.

H₂: There will be Gender difference in employees' Organizational Commitment.

H₃: Unionization has a significant effect on employees' Job Satisfaction.

H₄: Unionization has a significant effect on organizational commitment of employees.

2.0 Literature of Related Review

This section presents literature relevant to the concept of job satisfaction and organizational commitment, and how employees' associations facilitate or otherwise these work attitudes.

Job satisfaction and organizational commitment have received considerable attention from industrial and organizational psychologists, management scientists, and sociologists over the years. Building on the theories of Maslow, Frederick Herzberg (1974) suggested that the work itself could serve as a principal source of job satisfaction. His approach led to the aforementioned two-continuum model of job satisfaction where job satisfaction was placed on one continuum and job dissatisfaction was placed on a second. Herzberg's theory recognized that work characteristics generated by dissatisfaction were quite different from those created by satisfaction. He identified the factors that contribute to each dimension as "motivators" and "hygiene". The motivators are intrinsic factors that influence satisfaction based on fulfilment of higher level needs such as achievement, recognition, and opportunity for growth. The hygiene factors are extrinsic variables that such as work conditions, pay, and interpersonal relationships that must be met to prevent dissatisfaction. When hygiene factors are poor, work will be dissatisfying. However, simply removing the poor hygiene does not equate satisfaction.

Similarly, when people are satisfied with their job, motivators are present, but removing the motivators does not automatically lead to dissatisfaction. Essentially, job satisfaction depends on the extrinsic characteristics of the job, in relation to the job's ability to fulfil ones higher level needs of self-actualization. Hence, the two continuum model of Herzberg's Motivator-Hygiene factors theory.

Process theories attempt to explain job satisfaction by looking at expectancies and values (Gruneberg, 1979). This theory of job satisfaction suggests that workers' select their behaviours in order to meet their needs. Within this framework, Adams' (1963) and Vroom (1982) have become the most prominent theorists. Stacy Adams' suggested that people perceive their job as a series of inputs and outcomes. Inputs are factors such as experience, ability, and effort, while outcomes include things like salary, recognition, and opportunity. The theory is based on the premise that job satisfaction is a direct result of individuals' perceptions of how fairly they are treated in comparison to others. This "equity theory" proposes that people seek social equity in the rewards they expect for performance. Vroom's (1964) theory of job satisfaction was similar in that it looked at the

interaction between personal and workplace variables; however, he also incorporated the element of workers' expectations into his theory. The essence of this theory is that if workers put forth more effort and perform better at work, then they will be compensated accordingly. Discrepancies that occur between expected compensation and actual outcome lead to dissatisfaction. If employees receive less than they expect or otherwise feel as if they have been treated unfairly, then dissatisfaction may occur. Conversely, overcompensation may also lead to dissatisfaction and the employee may experience feelings of guilt. The compensation does not have to be monetary, but pay is typically the most visible and most easily modified element of outcome.

2.1 Determinant of Job Satisfaction

A review of the literature shows that numerous variables have been investigated in their relationship to job satisfaction. These variables include demographic data (e.g. age and gender) intrinsic features of the job (e.g. recognition, advancement, and responsibility), and extrinsic variables (e.g. salary, supervision, and working conditions).

2.1.1 Age

Research has often focused on age as a factor influencing job satisfaction. Available literature is somewhat inconclusive however, with some studies showing no significant impact (Miller, 1985; Brown, 1998), some showing a gradual linear increase of satisfaction as age increases (Hulin, 1963; Weaver, 1980; Anderson, Hohenshil & Brown, 1984; Sutter, 1994), and some suggesting that satisfaction is curvilinear and changes throughout the lifespan of the employee (Hertzberg et. al., 1957). Generally speaking, job satisfaction tends to increase gradually with age (Spector, 1997). Hertzberg et. al. (1957) attributes this trend to the fact that job expectations tend to become more realistic as employees age and mature. This pattern may change to show a relative decline in satisfaction after age 55 (Jewel, 1990), but this may be linked to the decreased physical energy and enthusiasm that may accompany the aging process. Still, many studies fail to show this late-career job satisfaction drop-off, and Quinn, Staines, and McCullough (1974) reported that older workers remain satisfied because of promotions and acquiring more desirable positions within organizations.

2.1.2 Gender

Gender has also received a great deal of attention in job satisfaction studies, but again the research is inconclusive. In 1997, Thompson and McNamara reviewed all job satisfaction studies published in the Educational Administration Quarterly over the past six years and showed no significant difference between male and female satisfaction levels. Smith, Smitz, and Hoy, (1998) arrived at similar insignificant findings until they compared the gender of the employee to the gender of the employer. They found that women were more significantly more satisfied than men in small companies with female supervision, while males were significantly more satisfied in larger companies with male supervisors. The inconsistencies, according to Gruneberg (1979), are closely linked to differences among expectations, respect, promotional prospects, salary, social interactions, and coping strategies of males and females and the jobs they often hold. Others suggest that men are more satisfied with their jobs than women because of unequal treatments in the workplace, and that under equal work conditions, women are more satisfied with their jobs than men.

2.1.3 Salary

Many researchers have identified salary as a fundamental variable in the study of job satisfaction (Miller, 1985; Derlin and Schnieder, 1994; Solly and Hohenshil, 1986) Furthermore, the relationship between salary and job satisfaction has been addressed by virtually all job satisfaction studies in the last 80 years. Although the earliest research suggested that salary was not a significant predictor of job satisfaction (Hoppock, 1935; Hertzberg, Mausner, Peterson and Capwell, 1957), later studies began to suggest that salary was a factor up to a certain point in an employee's career (Hertzberg, 1966). More recent studies have generally shown a positive relationship between pay and job satisfaction (Lucas et. al, 1990; Lee and Wilbur, 1985; Rhodes, 1983; Kanungo, 1982), but the relationship seems to be linked more to perceptions of equity and fairness than actual dollar amount (Hulin and Smith, 1965; Spector, 1997). According to Adams (1965), employees must feel that there is an equitable balance between the amount of work performed and the compensation received. In other words, if a worker feels that the compensation is either too large or too small for the amount of work performed, dissatisfaction may occur.

2.1.4 Interpersonal Factors

Within the context of job satisfaction research, interpersonal relationships are the elements that make up the social and support network of the employee. These elements include the relationship with one's supervisor, the social interaction with co-workers, and even the interactions with clients and/or customers. According to Brown (1998), employee supervision and interaction have been found to be the two most significant interpersonal factors when looking at job satisfaction. As far back as the Hawthorne Studies of the 1920's, research has shown that workers who belong to a social group and have friendships on the job tend to be more satisfied (Maynard, 1986). Maynard suggests further that employees who lack social support at work experience more stress, have less coping techniques, and are generally less satisfied. Fellow employees can satisfy many social needs, and

sympathetic and supportive co-workers can increase job satisfaction (Green, 2000). The nature of supervision provided can also have a significant impact on job satisfaction. Studies have shown that employees who have positive interactions with supervisors are generally more satisfied at work (Bruce and Blackburn, 1992; Vroom, 1982).

2.1.5 Intrinsic Factors

As aptly put by Bruce and Blackburn (1992), intrinsic part of peoples' lives "is often our source of identity and at times our reason for being" (p. 4). Aside decent pay, economic security, and other extrinsic and tangible rewards of employment, the intrinsic aspects of work are also relevant to the study of job satisfaction. Intrinsic factors are employees' affective reactions to the job, such as their satisfaction with the freedom they have to choose their own methods of working, the recognition that they receive for good work, and the opportunity they have to use their ability. Intrinsic factors may also include perceived respect and responsibility, task variety, and meaningful work. These personally rewarding intrinsic factors have demonstrated a significant impact on job satisfaction in many studies (Hertzberg et. al., 1957; O'Driscoll & Randall, 1999, Locke, 1976, Valentine & Dick, 1988).

McCue and Wright (1996) found that job satisfaction is enhanced by the value placed on one's professional role and identification with that role, but negatively affected by choosing the job because rewards are extrinsic (external to the work itself, such as fellow workers, salary, or promotion opportunities).

2.2 Trade Unions and Job Satisfaction

The relationship between job satisfaction and trade union membership has been a significant area of research. Various authors have investigated and commented on this area of research through different perspectives, and have come up with conclusions that vary from those of the others.

Heywood, Siebert and Wei (as cited in Artz, 2010) tried to find out the nature of the relationship between trade union membership and overall job satisfaction in their study by using waves 1991-1994 of British Household Panel Study and controlling the sorting of dissatisfied workers in trade union jobs. They found a negative relationship between trade union membership and job satisfaction. Kochan and Helfman (1981), and Borjas (1979) carried out their research by using trade union membership as a variable and came to the conclusion that there was a significant negative relationship between union membership and job satisfaction. However, Bryson, Cappellari and Lucifora (2004) took a slightly different approach and examined the employer - employee data from the 1998 British Workplace Employee Relations Survey (WERS). They sorted dissatisfied workers among union members and reported that there was no negative relation between trade union membership and job satisfaction, implying that dissatisfied union members would report job dissatisfaction irrespective of their union status (Bryson et. al., 2004). These conflicting outcomes of the variety of studies further emphasize the need for an alternate approach which could explore this relationship from an entirely new angle.

Berger, Olson and Boudreau (1983) also focused their study on particular components of job satisfaction and suggested that the union membership and the job outcomes (pay, job security, job structure, etc) received by workers are positively related with each other. Thus, if factors such as wages and employee benefits are taken into consideration, the negative impact of unionization on job satisfaction drops (Lange, 2009). Likewise, Labour Force Survey (2009), showed that the earnings of the union members were 15.3 per cent more than the earnings of the non-union members, - £13.60 per hour for union members as compared to £11.80 per hour for non-union members (Barratt, 2009). We expect and postulate therefore that unionised employees would be more satisfied than non-unionised employees.

However, Schwochau (1987) and Meng (1990) used union, wage and job satisfaction variables simultaneously in their research and came to a conclusion that union membership and job satisfaction were in fact negatively related (Renaud, 2002). Besides, both Freeman (1978), using the National Longitudinal survey of Mature Men. Borjas (as cited in Artz, 2010), in his cross section estimation of the Panel Survey of Income Dynamics, also concluded that there was a negative partial correlation of union membership on job satisfaction. Just like the debate over the nature of the relationship of job satisfaction and trade union membership, the debate over the nature of the relationship of pay satisfaction (a component of overall job satisfaction) and trade union membership has not come to a conclusive end, and highlights the need for further research to be conducted in this field by the adoption of new approaches.

Similarly, Gordon and Denisi (1995) also focused their study on a particular component of job satisfaction, and studied union and non-union members working in the same working environment, and found that the cause of dissatisfaction was poor working environment, as both the groups reported similar job satisfaction (Artz, 2010). Supporting this, Bender and Sloane (as cited in Renaud, 2002) concluded that if the poor working conditions were controlled, union dissatisfaction would experience a significant fall. Furthermore, in 2002, Renaud conducted a study to verify the universality of such a relationship and confirm the results of Bender and Sloane's study by using Canadian data and finding similar results (Artz, 2010). All these studies

show that having good working conditions is an essential component of overall job satisfaction, thus it would be used in this study to explore the nature of the relationship between overall job satisfaction and trade union membership. Lastly, According to Pfeffer & Davis-Blake (1990), “the voice hypothesis argues that unionization politicize the work force and make workers more critical towards the workplace and more willing to complain about problems. Again, the various studies fail to come to a consensus with respect to the nature of the relationship between job satisfaction and trade union membership.

2.3 Unionisation and Organizational Commitment

Guest (1991) observes that high organizational commitment is associated with lower turnover and absence, but there is no clear link to performance. It is probably wise not to expect too much from commitment as a means of making a direct and immediate impact on performance. It is not the same as motivation. Commitment is a broader concept and tends to withstand transitory aspects of an employee's job. It is possible to be dissatisfied with a particular feature of a job while retaining a reasonably high level of commitment to the organization as a whole. When creating a commitment strategy, Armstrong (1999) asserts that “it is difficult to deny that it is desirable for management to have defined strategic goals and values. And it is equally desirable from management point of view for employees to behave in a way that support those strategies and values.” Creating commitment includes communication, education, training programmes, and initiatives to increase involvement and ownership and the development of performance and reward management systems. Studies on commitment have provided strong evidence that affective and normative commitments are positively related and continuance commitment is negatively connected with organizational outcomes such as performance and citizenship behaviour (Hackett, Bycio, and Handsdoff, 1994; Shore and Wayne, 1993).

The relationship between employee commitment and trade union membership has also been an important area of research. Various authors have investigated and commented on this area of research through different perspectives, and have come up with conclusions that vary from those of the others. Roznowski and Hulin, (1992: 126-130) tried to untangle the nature of the relationship between trade union membership and employee commitment in their study by using experimental research. In the end they found that employees undertook specific changes in their behaviours-remaining in their respective jobs and also trying to affect changes on their job- that attempt to alter the work situation and came to the conclusion that there was a significant relationship between union membership and employee commitment. Further, Roznowski and Hulin maintain that low levels of employee commitment create one of four types of undesirable behaviour. First, dissatisfied individuals may attempt to increase job outcomes by stealing, using work time to pursue personal tasks, or by moonlighting. Second, they may withdraw from the job psychologically as manifested in such behaviour as not attending meetings, drinking on the job, or wandering about trying to look busy. Third, dissatisfied employees may practice behavioural withdrawal from the job as in absenteeism, turnover, or early retirement. Finally, employees may undertake specific change behaviours that attempt to alter the work situation.

Cole (1971) also found that Japanese workers do not rate high on measures of employee commitment when compared to workers in other countries such as the U.S. However, Japanese workers score “better” on the measures usually hypothesized to result from higher levels of employee commitment. Japanese workers have lower rates of absenteeism, work longer hours on average, and seldom use all of their allotted vacation time than American workers. It has been argued that such differences are due to higher levels of commitment by Japanese workers to the economic success of their firms which the unions enforce (Lincoln & Kalleberg, 1990).

From what is discussed so far, it is clear that the various studies fail to come to a consensus with respect to the nature of the relationship between organizational commitment and trade union membership. This study therefore sought to explore further how the situation is in Ghana.

3.0 Methodology

3.1 Research Design

The design for the study was a survey. A survey is a research design used to gather information about individuals through self-reports from study participants. A survey can be administered in a couple of different ways. In one method, a structured interview, where the researcher asks each participant questions and records the responses could be used. Another method involves the use of questionnaire where the participant completes the questionnaire on his or her own. In this research, the questionnaire type was used due to the following reasons: Questionnaires allow researchers to collect a large amount of data in a relatively short period of time, questionnaires are less expensive than many other data collection techniques, yet provide reliable results, if it is well standardized and validated.

3.2 Sample and Sampling Procedure

The total number of employees are used for the research were 400, consisting of 236 (59%) males and 164 (41%) females. Their ages range from 18 years to 56 year, with 224 (56%) of the employees belong to unions in their organisation, and the remaining 176 (44%) were non-union members (see table 1).

From Table 1, out of the 224 unionised employees, 132 of them were males and 92 of them were females. With a total number of 176 non-unionised employees, 104 of them were males and 72 of them were females.

3.3 Instrument

The questionnaires used for the study were adapted and put into three sections. The section (A) dealt with the background information of the respondents. Section (B) consisted of Weiss, Dawis, England, & Lofquist (1967) twenty (20) items Minnesota satisfaction questionnaire. The MSQ is designed to measure specific aspects of an employee's satisfaction with his or her job, and it provides more information on the rewarding aspects of a job than do more general measures of job satisfaction. The MSQ is a gender-neutral, self-administered paper-and-pencil inventory that is written on a fifth-grade level. It is rated on a standard five-point response scale. Response choices are "Very Satisfied", "Satisfied", "N" (Neither Satisfied nor Dissatisfied), "Dissatisfied" and "Very Dissatisfied." The short form is less time consuming- it can be completed in about 5 minutes while the long form can be completed in 15 to 20 minutes, hence, we used the short form base on its advantage over the long form.

We adapted the MSQ because it accurately measures job satisfaction, and identifies specific areas that impact performance and human behaviour in the workplace. It is also highly valid and reliable, easy to use, easy to understand and applicable to any organization be it for managers, supervisors, or employees.

Section (C) comprises of two parts, the first part consist of eighteen items and sought information on the nature and degree of commitment using Meyer and Allen organizational commitment questionnaire (OCQ). The studies used Meyer and Allen questionnaire because of it psychometric properties of the scales, particularly its validity and reliability and it ability to measure commitment in those three areas (affective, continuance and normative). The OCQ was also adapted because it accurately measures employees' commitment and identifies specific areas of human behaviour in the workplace. Furthermore, it is highly valid and reliable, easy to use, easy to understand and appropriate for any organization. The second part also sought information on the personal philosophy affecting unionization.

3.4 Data Collection Procedure

The set questionnaire was administered personally by the researchers. We met managers of the various insurance institutions with an introduction letter from the head of Department of Educational Foundations, University of Cape Coast for permission to conduct the study. The administration of the questionnaire went smoothly and it took 21 days to get it done. In all, 450 questionnaires were distributed and 400 were retrieved. Hence, the returned rate was 88.89%.

4.0 Results and Discussion

The study sought to answer one research question, besides the research hypotheses. Research question 1 was about employees' perception of the importance of unionization. The table below presents the results of respondents' perception of the importance of unionization.

The result presented in table 6 shows that 348(87%) of the employees perceived unionization to be important while only 52(13%) of the employees perceived unionization not to be important. This could be as result of the active role unions play in grievance and arbitration procedures, rules governing promotion, transfers, discipline, dismissals, and the economic benefits, working hours and terms of the wage- work bargain.

The results further indicate that 196 (56.3%) of those who believe that unionization is important were males and 152(43.7%) were females (see table 3)

Hypothesis 1 involved the test of gender difference in respondents' Job Satisfaction. Gender was hypothesized to influence Job Satisfaction of employees. To test this hypothesis, the independent samples t-test was used. The result (table 9) indicates that there was no significant difference between males ($M=73.40$, $SD=10.21$, $d = -1.91$) and females' ($M= 75.31$, $SD= 10.34$) Job Satisfaction.

Hypothesis 2 also involved the test of gender difference in Organizational Commitment. The results presented in table 8 above again indicate that, male employees ($M= 55.91$, $SD=8.98$, $d =.60$) and female employees ($M=53.31$, $SD= 8.95$) did not statistically differ in terms of their commitment to their organisations. The study further went on to explore gender difference in the various component of organisational commitment (Affective, Continuance and Normative Commitment). Again, there was no significant gender difference in any of the three component of Organizational Commitment. Hypothesis two was therefore not supported. Thus, male and females did not differ significantly in terms of their commitment to their organisations. The current study supports the findings of Thompson and McNamara (1997), and Smith, Smitz, and Hoy, (1998) who also found no significant difference between male and female satisfaction levels.

Hypothesis 3 involved the test of the effect of Unionization on Job Satisfaction. The results in table 10 indicate that, there was no significance difference in Unionized and non-unionized employees' level of Job Satisfaction. The mean and standard deviations for unionized employees and non- unionized employees are ($M=$

74.28, SD = 10.51, $d = .54$) and ($M = 73.88$, SD = 10.03) respectively.

Hypothesis 4: "Unionization has a significant effect on employees' organizational commitment," was also tested using the independent samples t-test. The result indicated that there was no significant difference between unionized and non-unionized employees' organizational commitment. Further, the sub-components in Organizational Commitment were also tested and the results indicate that there was no significant difference between unionized and non-unionized employees with respect to any of the sub-categories of organizational commitment.

Researchers like Heywood, Siebert and Wei (2002) reported from their findings that Trade Union had negative effect on Job Satisfaction. Kochan and Helfman (1981) and Borjas (1975) carried out their research by using trade union membership as a variable and came to the conclusion that there was a significant negative relationship between union membership and job satisfaction.

However, Bryson, Cappellari and Lucifora (2004) took a slightly different approach and examined the employer - employee data from the 1998 British Workplace Employee Relations Survey (WERS). They reported that there was no negative relation between trade union membership and job satisfaction, implying that dissatisfied union members would report job dissatisfaction irrespective of their union status (Bryson, Cappellari, & Lucifora, 2004). Berger, Olson and Boudreau (1983) also focused their study on particular components of job satisfaction and suggested that the union membership and the job outcomes (pay, job security, job structure, etc) received by workers are positively related. Thus, if factors such as wages and employee benefits are taken into consideration, the negative impact of unionization on job satisfaction will drop.

The current findings state that union membership or otherwise do not have any significant effect on employees' job satisfaction and organizational commitment.

4.1 Summary of Main Findings

The study brought into its wake a number of findings. On the nature or the extent to which unionisation affect job satisfaction and organisational commitment, the results showed that there were no significant difference between unionised and non-unionised employees' job satisfaction and organizational commitment.

The study also revealed that majority of the workers perceived unionisation to be important in an organisation since unions are primarily concerned with industrial jurisprudence, thus, being involved in grievance and arbitration procedures, rules governing promotion, transfers, discipline, dismissals, and the economic regulation of employment regulation of salaries, benefits, working hours and terms of the wage-work bargain.

Finally, concerning the effect gender has on job satisfaction and organisational commitment, it was found out that there were no significant differences between males and females' satisfaction and commitment.

4.2 Conclusions

The empirical evidence indicates that neither trade union membership nor gender affects job satisfaction and organizational commitment. Though the result did not support the hypotheses, it clearly tells us that vast majority of employees perceive unionization to be important as it helps them to better their working conditions. Schwochau (1987) believes that the relationship between union membership and job satisfaction is complex and not fully understood, but this study, however, has helped us to clear the doubt relating to relationship between union membership and job satisfaction and employee commitment through its empirical evidence that unionization does not affect employees' job satisfaction and organizational commitment.

4.3 Recommendation for Policy and Practice

From the research, though unionization has no significant effect on employees job satisfaction and organizational commitment, we recommend to employers that they should recognized the existence of these unions in their companies, include them in formulating of company policies and negotiate with them on behalf of other employees since it will them achieve their aim, since a great number of the employees view unionisation as very important aspect of their occupational life.

References

- Armstrong, M. (1999). Human resources management practice. London: Kogan Page
- Anderson, W.T., Hohenshil, T. H., & Brown, D.T. (1984). Job satisfaction among practicing school psychologists: A national study. *School Psychology Review*. 13. p. 225-230
- Artz, B. (2010). The impact of union experience on job satisfaction". *Industrial Relations*. 49 (3). p. 387-405
- Barrat, C. (2009). *Trade Union Membership 2008*, London: BERR
- Berger, G. J., Olson, C.A. and Boudreau, J. W. (1983). Effects of unions on job satisfaction: the role of work-related values and perceived rewards. *Organizational Behaviour and Human Performance*. 14. p. 21-40.
- Borjas, G. J. (1979). Job satisfaction, wages and unions. *Journal of Human Resources*. 14. p. 21-40.
- Brown, M., Hohenshil, T.H., & Brown, D. (1998). School Psychologists' job satisfaction in the USA: A national study. *School Psychology International Journal*. 19 (1). p.79-89.

- Bruce, W. M. & Blackburn, J. W. (1992). *Balancing job satisfaction and performance: A guide for human resource professionals*. Westport, Conn.: Quorum Books, 4-23.
- Bryson, A., Cappellari, L., and Lucifora, C. (2004), "Does union membership really reduce job satisfaction?". *British Journal of Industrial Relations*. 43 (1). p. 67-92.
- Ghana TUC Policy Bulletin, (2009) Vol. 5, No. 1 & 3
- Green, J. (2000). *Job satisfaction of community college chairpersons*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Virginia Polytechnic and State University, Blacksburg, VA.
- Gruneberg, M. M. (1979). *Understanding job satisfaction*. New York: Macmillan
- Guest, E.A. (1991). *Human resource management*. London: McGraw-Hill.
- Hall Meyer, J.P., & Allen, N.J. (1991). A three component conceptualization of organizational commitment. *Human Resource Management Review*. 1. p. 61-89.
- Herzberg, F. (1957). *Work and the Nature of Man*, Cleveland, World Publishers.
- Hoppock, R. (1935). *Job Satisfaction*. New York: Harper Brothers.
- Hulin, C. L., & Smith, P. C. (1965). A linear model of job satisfaction. *Journal of Applied Psychology*. 49 (3). p. 209-216.
- Jewell, Linda (1990). *Contemporary industrial/organizational psychology*. St. Paul; West Publishing Company, College & School Division
- Kanungo, R. (1982). *Work alienation*. New York: Praeger Publishers
- Kochan, T. A. and Helfman, D. E. (1981). "The effects of collective bargaining on economic and behavioural job outcomes". *Research in Labour Economics*. 4. p. 321-65.
- Lee, R., & Wilbur, E. R. (1985). Age, education, job tenure, salary, job characteristics, and job satisfaction: A multivariate analysis. *Human Relations*. 38. p. 781-791
- Locke, E. (1976). The nature and causes of job satisfaction. In Dunnette, M.D. *Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology*. Chicago: Rand McNally
- Maynard, M. (1986). Measuring work and support network satisfaction. *Journal of Employment Counselling*. 23. p. 9-19.
- Miller, N. J. (1985). *A description of secondary school principals in Minnesota and their job satisfaction*. An authorized facsimile of an unpublished doctoral dissertation (University of North Dakota, Grand Forks, 1985)
- Northcraft, T. & Neale, H. (1996). *Organisation Behaviour*. London: Prentice-Hall
- O'Driscoll, M. P., & Randall, D. M. (1999). Perceived organisational support, satisfaction with rewards, and employee job involvement and organisational commitment. *Applied Psychology: An International Review*. 48 (2). p. 197-209.
- Solly, D. C., & Hohenshil, T. H. (1986). Job satisfaction of school psychologists in a primarily rural state. *School Psychology Review*. 15 (1). p. 119-126.
- Thompson, D., & McNamara, J. (1997). Job satisfaction in educational organizations: A synthesis of research findings. *Educational Administration Quarterly*. 33 (1). p.1-31.
- Weaver, C. (1977). Relationships among pay, race, sex, and job satisfaction. *Personnel Psychology*. 26. p. 545-557
- Weiss, D. J., Dawis, R. V., England, G. W., & Lofquist, L. H. (1967). *Manual for the Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire*. Minneapolis, MN: The University of Minnesota Press
- Valentine, S., Valentine, W. R., & Dick, J. (1998). Intrinsic and extrinsic motivators and older employees' attitudes towards their current jobs. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*. 87. p. 407-410.
- Vocational Psychology Research, (2002). Retrieved from the World Wide Web on December 2, 2002 <http://www.psych.umn.edu/psylabs/vpr/default.htm>.
- Vroom, V. H. (1982). *Work and motivation (Rev. ed.)*. Malabar, FL: Robert E. Krieger Publishing Company.

Tables:

Table 1: Gender Distribution of Union Membership

Gender	Unionized	Non-unionized	Total
Male	132	104	236 (59%)
Female	92	72	164 (41%)
Total	224 (56%)	176 (44%)	400 (100%)

Source: Field work, April 2012

Table 2: Participants' Perception of Unions

Unionization is important	Frequency	(%)
Yes	348	87
No	52	13
Total	400	100

Source: Field work, April 2012

Table 3: Gender Distribution of Perceived importance of unionization

Gender	Yes	No	Total
Male	196 (56.3%)	40	236
Female	152(43.7%)	12	164
Total	348	52	400

Source: Field work, April 2012

Table 4: T-test of the Effect of Gender Difference on Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment

	Gender	Mean	SD	t score	df	sig(2 tailed)
Job satisfaction	Male	73.40	10.21	-.915	398	.362
	Female	75.31	10.34	-	-	-
Affective commit.	Male	17.25	3.56	.566	398	.573
	Female	16.85	3.35	-	-	-
Continuance commit.	Male	17.77	4.04	.142	398	.888
	Female	17.65	4.43	-	-	-
Normative commit.	Male	20.88	4.49	.088	398	.930
	Female	20.80	3.92	-	-	-
Org. Commitment	Male	55.91	8.98	.328	398	.744
	Female	53.31	8.95	-	-	-

Source: Field work, April 2012

Table 5:t-test of the Effect of Unionization on Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment

	Belongs to union	Mean	SD	t score	df	sig(2 tailed)
Job satisfaction	Unionized	74.42	10.51	.261	398	.795
	Non-unionized	73.88	10.03	-	-	-
Aff commit.	Unionized	17.34	3.52	.810	398	.420
	Non-unionized	16.77	3.40	-	-	-
Cont. commit.	Unionized	17.07	3.99	-1.795	398	.076
	Non-unionized	18.56	4.31	-	-	-
Norm. commit.	Unionized	20.76	4.13	-.217	398	.829
	Non-unionized	20.95	4.43	-	-	-
Org. Commit	Unionized	55.17	8.09	-.619	398	.537
	Non-unionized	56.30	9.96	-	-	-

Source: Field work, April 2011

This academic article was published by The International Institute for Science, Technology and Education (IISTE). The IISTE is a pioneer in the Open Access Publishing service based in the U.S. and Europe. The aim of the institute is Accelerating Global Knowledge Sharing.

More information about the publisher can be found in the IISTE's homepage:

<http://www.iiste.org>

CALL FOR JOURNAL PAPERS

The IISTE is currently hosting more than 30 peer-reviewed academic journals and collaborating with academic institutions around the world. There's no deadline for submission. **Prospective authors of IISTE journals can find the submission instruction on the following page:** <http://www.iiste.org/journals/> The IISTE editorial team promises to review and publish all the qualified submissions in a **fast** manner. All the journals articles are available online to the readers all over the world without financial, legal, or technical barriers other than those inseparable from gaining access to the internet itself. Printed version of the journals is also available upon request of readers and authors.

MORE RESOURCES

Book publication information: <http://www.iiste.org/book/>

Recent conferences: <http://www.iiste.org/conference/>

IISTE Knowledge Sharing Partners

EBSCO, Index Copernicus, Ulrich's Periodicals Directory, JournalTOCS, PKP Open Archives Harvester, Bielefeld Academic Search Engine, Elektronische Zeitschriftenbibliothek EZB, Open J-Gate, OCLC WorldCat, Universe Digital Library, NewJour, Google Scholar

