

# The Performance of the State's Civil Apparatus Staffing Agencies in the Education and Training Area Ponorogo

Ismoyo

Master of public administration, Faculty of social and political sciences, Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta  
Jl. Ir. Sutami No.36A, Jebres, Surakarta, Central Java Indonesia

## Abstract

Facing a new paradigm in the field of government, in the areas of management personnel have been issued law number 5 Year 2015 about Staffing Management. Some of the new things that are important and need to get attention, namely: (1) the emphasis of the construction of civil servants based on the system of feats work, competence and professionalism, (2) the professionalism of civil servants which the state apparatus/government should be able to maintain neutrality by separating the country office with the Office of the land, and (3) decentralized local government against staffing authority which is one unified network system bureaucracy in staffing nationwide. The phenomenon exists in the staffing agency of the education and training area (BKPPD) Ponorogo as establishments that have the function of giving civil service administration services effectively and efficiently and to optimize the performance of the apparatus the maintainer staffing: employee dissatisfaction against the ministry in dealing with the complaints, the work has not been completed on time in accordance with the time limit which has been specified, it is still an error-error in typing the Letter Decision (SK), SK Promotion, Periodic salary increases as well as SK, SK Placement in the position. The purpose of this research is to find out and describe the performance of the State's Civil Apparatus Staffing Agencies In The Education And Training Area Ponorogo (BKPPD) in this case the performance views of corporate responsibility, responsiveness and accountability. The main data source in the form of the words and actions of the rest is additional data, such as documents, photos, statistical data. The source of the data used in this research is the Informant/resource person i.e. interview and document/archive. The data collected is reduced in the form of selection and simplification of data and then taken the conclusion as well as evaluate how far the indicator responsiveness, corporate responsibility and accountability to the performance of the apparatus BKPPD. The methods used in this research is descriptive qualitative. Data gathering with purposive sampling technique with interviews to 12 employees, during the period 6 April – 31 March 2017. The results of this research show that the performance of the apparatus at the BKPPD Ponorogo categorized better. The study also shows that (1). BKPPD Ponorogo quite responsive to complaints that there are though still there is some weakness (2) level of corporate responsibility BKPPD Ponorogo is quite good, but there are still some flaws (3) accountability of the BKPPD has been very well, the look of the work and reporting implemented. Each policy taken accounted for starting from planning to results achieved. In each time period of service there are already standard with the Standard operational procedure (SOP) in BKPPD Ponorogo. So there is already a rule that raw about each type of service. The study also gives suggestions about the need for complaints management and service in accordance with standard operational procedures resulting in the granting of service going on harmonious relationships between employees and recipients of services BKPPD staffing

**Keywords:** performance, responsiveness, responsibility, accountability

## 1. Introduction

The deterioration of the nation of Indonesia in the multidimensional crisis prolonged showed Indonesia's inability to align with the position of other countries in Southeast Asia. The existence of bureaucracy in order practices often provoke controversy and debate because of attitudes and performance of the apparatus of Government is still low. Problems of KKN (corruption, collusion, and nepotism) as well as the complicated bureaucratic procedures have become a burden to the country to face competition in global scope.

At present, the performance of the bureaucracy into a spotlight of many parties, especially since the existence of the Reformation who demanded a more democratic climate in implementing governance and development. Law Number 32 Year 2004 about local governance gives existence to the authority the area accompanied by the granting of the rights and obligations of the organizer of the autonomous region in the unity of the system of organization of State Government.

The performance is "results obtained by a good organization the organization is non-profit oriented and non-profit oriented produced during one period" (Fahmi, 2014). Performance in an organization can be demonstrated by how the process of the ongoing activities to achieve those goals. In this process of implementation activities must always be done on monitoring, assessment and review or the review on performance of human resources. Implement performance management will provide benefits for organizations, teams, and individuals.

The phenomenon exists staffing agencies in the education and training (BKPPD) Ponorogo as

establishments that have the function of giving civil service administration services effectively and efficiently and to optimize the performance of the apparatus the maintainer staffing: employee dissatisfaction against the ministry in dealing with the complaints, the work has not been completed on time in accordance with the time limit which has been specified, it is still an error in typing the letter decision (SK), SK Promotion, Periodic salary increases as well as SK, SK Placement in the position. Therefore, BKPPD as a public organization Ponorogo being required to improve the performance of the organization be optimized both in terms of the implementation of the work programme as well as the awarding of services to the whole scope of civil servants Ponorogo. View of the duties and functions that are so big, the claim for optimal performance results is a necessity that should be realized.

### 1.1 Formulation Of The Problem

"How can the performance of the state's civil apparatus in the staffing of the Agency's education and training area (BKPPD) Ponorogo in this performance views of responsibility, responsiveness and accountability?"

### 1.2 Research Objectives

The purpose of this study was to describe the performance of the state's civil apparatus in the staffing of the Agency's education and training area (BKPPD) Ponorogo in this performance views of corporate responsibility, responsiveness and accountability

### 1.3 Benefits of Research

#### 1.3.1 Theoretical Benefits

- a. The related application gives an overview of the science of public administration particularly on issues related to the assessment of performance against the employees in environmental red tape as well as donations for researchers who will be conducting further research.
- b. as material evaluation for performance assessment program enacted in the institutions of local governance.

#### 1.3.2 Practical uses

- a. The results of this research are expected to be input to the development of the assessment and performance improvement program for employees so that they can berdayaguna in conducting development and community service.
- b. this study can serve as a reference material human resources management at the local government organization.

## 2. Review Of The Literature

### 2.1 The concept of Performance

#### 2.1.1 Understanding the performance

The term performance is the translation of the performance that is often defined as the appearance, performance or achievements. Essentially the performance can be seen in terms of the other two, namely the performance of the employees (individuals) and organizational performance. Employee performance was the work of an individual within an organization. While the performance of the organization is the totality of the work that is within an organization.

The performance is "results obtained by a good organization the organization is non-profit oriented and non-profit oriented produced during one period" (Fahmi, 2014). "Performance is the result of the work that has a strong relationship with the strategic objectives of the Organization, our satisfaction consumer, and contributes to the economy" (Armstrong and Baron Wibowo, 2010). While Bastian (2006) States that the performance was "a reflection of the level of achievement of the implementation of an activity/program/wisdom in realizing the objectives, goals, mission, vision of the Organization contained in the formulation of the strategic scheme ( strategic planning) of an organization. " "Performance is a note about the results obtained from certain job functions or specific activity during the specified time" (Bernardin & Russel in Rakhmat, 2009). Performance is the implementation of the functions required of a person. Understanding according to Whitmore is the sense that demands the most minimal needs to succeed. Therefore posited notions of performance Whitmore deems representative, then tergambarnya the great responsibilities of the job a person (Whitmore in the Uno and Lamatenggo, 2012).

In addition, the performance was "the activity of a person in performing basic tasks charged to him" (King in the Uno and Lamatenggo, in 2012). According to Prawiro Suntoro (Tika, 2005) that the performance was "the work of a person or a group of people in an organization in order to achieve the goal of orgnisasi in a certain time period."

Based on some understanding of the performance of the above, the researcher defines that performance as a result of the work of the person/group to achieve the goals of an organization in a certain period. It is understood

that the concept of performance not only on individual performance, but the performance of the group in the organization.

Performance as a result of the work of the person/group to achieve the goals of an organization in a certain period. It is understood that the concept of performance not only on individual performance, but the performance of the group in the organization.

#### 2.1.2 Understanding the performance assessment

Performance assessment is essentially a key factors in order to develop an organization effectively and efficiently because of the policies and programs that better over existing human resources in the organization. Individual performance appraisal is very beneficial to the dynamics of the growth of the Organization as a whole, according to the assessment of the actual conditions can be known about how the performance of employees.

#### 2.1.3 Performance indicators

Agus Dwiyanto (2006:50) public bureaucracy performance measure based on the existence of an indicator that is further explained as follows:

- a. Productivity
- b. quality of services
- c. Responsiveness
- d. corporate responsibility
- e. Accountability

The author chose to use performance measurement theories advanced by Agus Dwiyanto (2006) as is seen fit, more precise and better able to measure the performance of the state's civil apparatus in the staffing of the Agency's education and training area (BKPPD) Ponorogo.

Performance measurement indicators expressed by Agus Dwiyanto (2006:50) includes five indicators, i.e. productivity, service quality, responsiveness, accountability and corporate responsibility. Of the five indicators above, researchers prefer to use three indicators alone, namely responsiveness, corporate responsibility and accountability. These three indicators were chosen on the grounds that this weaker indicators has represented some of the indicators used to assess the performance of a public organization from within and outside the organization.

Based on performance indicators according to some sources above, researchers using performance indicators in accordance with the conditions of the employees in the Agency's staffing of regional education and training (BKPPD) Ponorogo, namely:

- a) Responsiveness; bureaucratic ability to identify community needs, drawing up the agenda and the priorities of the ministry, as well as develop programs services according to needs and aspirations of the community. Includes:
  - (1) No complaints from service users over the last year
  - (2) The attitude of the bureaucracy officials in responding to complaints
  - (3) The use of the complaint a reference for improvement of organizing services in the future;
  - (4) action to provide satisfaction services
- b) Responsibility; explain whether the implementation of the organization's activities are conducted in accordance with the principles of correct administration or in accordance with the organization's policy, it is the responsibility of the person towards his duties associated with the role to the person served. Include the following:
  - (1) Attend regularly and on time.
  - (2) Follow the instructions and compliance with procedures
  - (3) Technical competence
  - (4) Complete the task and fulfill the responsibility of the appropriate time limits specified
- c) Accountability; have the sense of responsibility which is one of the characteristics of the applied good governance, in the public administration is the issue toward clean government or a Government that is clean. Accountability is seen from the point of view of control is an action on the achievement of objectives, including:
  - (1) Avoidance of corruption and collusion
  - (2) The existence of a public service that is carefully
  - (3) Responsibility have been made
  - (4) Guarantee his policies that have been taken.

This research uses the theory of institutions or institutional theory because the staffing agency for the education and training Area Ponorogo according the opinion of John w. Meyer and Brian Rowan (1977) that "many of the positions, policies, programs and procedures modern organizations are influenced by public opinion, the views of constituents, the legitimate knowledge through the education system, social prestige, the law, and the courts. So according to this view essentially tells us that organizational behavior or decisions taken by the Organization will be affected by the existing institutions outside the organization. Organizations will be

able to adjust to the pressure from the outside to the mempertahankan of its existence.

## 2.2 The factors that affect performance

Of the opinions above, it can be concluded that generally factors under the performance of employees, namely:

- 1) Individual Factors, including ability, creativity, innovation, initiative, willingness, confidence, motivation and commitment of the individuals.
- 2) Organizational Factors), including clarity of purpose, compensation is given, leadership, work, or the given infrastructure organization, process organization and the working culture in the organization.
- 3) Social Factors), including the quality of the support and encouragement given by teammates, trust of fellow team members, equality and the cohesiveness of the team members, as well as security.

## 2.3 The civil State Apparatus

In a society that is always evolving, human beings always have more important positions, although Indonesia is heading to the community-oriented work, which looked at work is something noble, does not mean ignore humans who carry out such work. Similarly in an organization, a very human element to determine whether or not walking all as an organization towards the achievement of the objectives specified depends on the ability of man to move the organization toward has been set. Humans are involved in this organization, also known as the civil State apparatus

## 2.4 Organization

The organization is a system consisting of a person or group of people consisting of superiors and subordinates are mutually interact and cooperate to achieve the goals and specific targets. Staffing Agencies in this Area is an organization of Ponorogo public which has objectives, goals, mission, and vision of the organization.

## 2.5 The framework of thought

Performance appraisal is a very important coming together because activity can be used as a measure of success in achieving the objectives of an organization and its vision and mission. By conducting assessment of performance, then an effort to improve performance can be done in a purposeful and systematic so that the Organization could walk effectively, efficient, and responsive in providing service. In addition the performance assessment can also be used to acknowledge and assess how much service provided by the Organization to meet expectations and satisfy customers.

The phenomenon exists in the staffing of the agency's education and training area (BKPPD) Ponorogo as establishments that have the function of giving civil service administration services effectively and efficiently and to optimize the performance of the apparatus the maintainer staffing: employee dissatisfaction against the ministry in dealing with the complaints, the work has not been completed on time in accordance with the time limit which has been specified, it is still an error in typing the letter decision (SK), SK Promotion, Periodic salary increases as well as SK, SK Placement in office.

The indicators used to measure performance according to researchers that is is responsifitas, responsibility and accountability. These indicators were selected because of the indicators rated third by researchers as an indicator of the most appropriate and can serve as a yardstick to assess the performance of the Agency's Personnel training and education District Ponorogo in service. Through performance measurement by using such indicators can we know whether the performance of Agency Personnel education and training Area Ponorogo already optimally or not. With the optimal performance of the employees, then the employee will be expected to settle against the ministry staffing of the Agency's education and training area (BKPPD) Ponorogo

## 3. Research Methods

### 3.1 The location of Research

This research was carried out in Ponorogo, East Java province, in the Office of the civil service agency of the education and training area (BKPPD) Ponorogo. As for the selection of the location of the research done by the consideration that the BKD Ponorogo is a government agency which has the function of giving civil service administration services effectively and efficiently to optimize the performance of the apparatus staffing manager. View of the duties and functions that are so big, the claim for optimal performance results is a necessity which should be realized

### 3.2 Types of Research

This research uses qualitative descriptive method. The research method is closely associated with this type of research is used, since every study done of course in order to reach a goal of research itself.

### 3.3 Data source

The main qualitative research data sources in the form of the words and actions of the rest is additional data, such as documents, photos, statistics, and others (Moleong, 2012). Related to this, then the type of qualitative research data in the form of words and actions, the data source is written, photographs and statistics.

The source of the data used in this research are:

1. Informant/resource person
2. Documents/archive

### 3.4 Data collection Techniques.

1. Interview
2. Observations
3. Documentation

### 3.5 Techniques in determination of the informant

The informant/resource person is consenting really know about issues that will be examined. Data obtained directly from the informant/this resource is primary data. The informant/resource person selected by the method of purposive, i.e. based on consideration and specific objectives (Sugiyono, 2015). Researchers tend to choose informants that are considered trustworthy and know to be the source of the data to know the performance problems in the civil servants Agency Personnel education and training Area Ponorogo in depth

### 3.6 Data analysis techniques

1. Data Reduction
2. Presentation of data
3. The verification conclusion and Withdrawal

The data collected is reduced in the form of selection and simplification of data and then taken the conclusion. Data obtained from the interview against the parties pertaining to the staffing of the Agency's performance in the assessment of the education and training Area Ponorogo. From those results and then drawn a conclusion.

## 4. Discussion

Based on research results, then it can be said that the performance of BKPPD Ponorogo researched through three indicators, namely, responsibility, responsiveness, and accountability can be summed up good well. This means that the level of responsibility, responsiveness, and accountability of the public service is carried out BKPPD Ponorogo is good enough.

The results of research that States that the degree of responsiveness of Ponorogo BKPPD enough, means that the employees or the bureaucracy that existed at BKPPD Ponorogo quite able to live up to expectations, desires and aspirations and demands of its customers i.e. the government environmental employees in Ponorogo.

But the ministry still showing weakness, where still on the case BKPPD Ponorogo this weakness has not been developed due to the external communication effectively by the bureaucratic ranks of the service, so there is still a gap between customer expectations with real conditions. External communication that has not been developed yet from look real existence of a complaints handling management tersistematika and well documented.

In realizing the government's efforts in improving the quality of public services, have a strategic role responsiveness so that each activity has a value added of service bureaucracy in an effort to increase customer satisfaction.

Research results also showed that the level of responsibility BKPPD Ponorogo is enough, so that it can be said that the responsibility service on BKPPD Ponorogo quite capable of providing service to the customers, but still found some weaknesses. Corporate responsibility refers to the condition of the human resources ministry apparatus, so that existing conditions is able to provide a good service. This condition not only things that looks at the behavioral apparatus, but also attitudes associated apparatus service.

The Ministry apparatus describing the behavior of corporate responsibility services and where it is still lacking is the level of technical competence of Ministry apparatus. This is because the presence of standard of competence yet apparatus service, so that the Ministry can be done by anyone who is sometimes less technical ability which ultimately impact on the corporate responsibility services less anyway.

The last indicator is accountability, which the results showed that BKPPD service accountability Ponorogo is also quite good. This means that accountability over the service of process is done by BKPPD Ponorogo is quite good, but also still found certain things that still need to be improved.

Accountability services implemented BKPPD Ponorogo quite fulfill the value of transparency because it reveals clearly the procedure the Ministry through the assignment procedure the Ministry and information

Ministry. But of the value of Justice, still not all be met because a certain person (such as acting) treated differently with others in providing services.

Based on the entire description, then it can be said that the services provided by BKPPD Ponorogo quite a good run though a few things are still likely to be increased so that it is able to improve the satisfaction of employees in the environment The Government of Ponorogo as customers BKPPD Ponorogo.

Table 1. Summary Of Research Results

Aspects	Indicator		Interpretation Results	Proof
<b>Responsiveness</b>	A	With the least or no complaints from users of the service for the past year	Less	complaints is very small less than 20 complaint
	B	Bureaucratic apparatus Attitude in responding to complaints	Good	85% of complaints are processed in the field
	C	Use of complaint referrals for improvement of organization of the ministry in the future	Good	A decrease in the number of complaints in the last 3 years
	D	Action to provide satisfaction services	Enough	Community Satisfaction Index Value

<b>Responsibility</b>	A	Attend regularly and on time	Good	90% of employees have filled the list present
	B	Follow the instructions of obedience to the procedure	Good	There is never any penalties employee discipline
	C	Technical competence	Less	Less than 20% of employees have the appropriate training certificates with his work
	D	Complete the tasks and fulfill the responsibility of the appropriate time limits specified	Enough	50% of the work was carried out on time or less than a specified time

<b>Accountability</b>	A	The avoidance of corruption and collusion	Good	Findings of the BPK
	B	The existence of public services that are closely	Less	List of errors/fixes
	C	Charge has been made	Good	Performance reports
	D	Guarantee his policies that have been taken are determined	Good	The value of the SAKIP

Tabel 2. Matric Research Data

Aspects	Indicator		Data	There Is/Are Not
<b>Responsiveness</b>	A	With the least or no complaints from users of the service for the past year	List of Complaints and follow-up	There is
	B	Bureaucratic apparatus Attitude in responding to complaints	List of Complaints and follow-up	There is
	C	Use of complaint referrals for improvement of organization of the ministry in the future	The number of complaints in the last 3 years	There is
	D	Action to provide satisfaction services	Customer satisfaction survey instrument	There is
<b>Responsibility</b>	A	Attend regularly and on time	Presensi civil state apparatus	There is
	B	Follow the instructions of obedience to the procedure	SOP Service	There is
	C	Technical competence	Certificate of training	There is
	D	Complete the tasks and fulfill the responsibility of the appropriate time limits specified	List of service karsu/karis/karpeg	There is
<b>Accountability</b>	A	The avoidance of corruption and collusion	The findings of the BPK the year 2016	There is
	B	The existence of public services that are closely	List of errors/fixes	There is
	C	Charge has been made	Performance reports	There is
	D	Guarantee his policies that have been taken are determined	SAKIP	There is

## 5. Conclusions

### 5.1 Responsiveness

Based on the results of the research in the future, then it can be inferred that BKPPD Ponorogo quite responsive to complaints that there are though still there is some disadvantages include :

- 1) Handling complaints have yet to become a priority of the work, as evidenced by the existence of a complaints handling SOP yet
- 2) has not been terdokumentasikannya complaints, so the difficulty when will conduct an evaluation of whether any complaints been handled properly
- 3) Yet the existence of means to find out the level of customer satisfaction, so there is no identified whether or not already satisfied customers
- 4) there is no mechanism to guarantee the BKPPD bureaucracy Ponorogo making complaints as a basis for improvements to the service system as a whole.

### 5.2 Responsibility

Based on the results of the research in the future, then it can be concluded that the level of corporate responsibility BKPPD Ponorogo is quite good, but still there are some disadvantages include:

- 1) Yet he arranges standard of competence for the position of general functional, so it could not be known with certainty level of competence of employees providing services
- 2) Haven't done sorting service responsibilities on BKPPD Ponorogo services became the responsibility of the other party so still impressed yet can finish the job on time according the time limit which has been specified

### 5.3 Accountability

Based on the results of the research, it can be inferred that any policy taken in Ponorogo BKPPD can bertanggungjawabkan ranging from planning to results achieved. Officially for each time period of service there are already standard with the SOP in BKPPD Ponorogo. So there is already a rule that raw about each type of service.

Thus it can be said, that the accountability of BKPPD is quite good. Employees already are transparent and clearly according to standards of service that is in a SOP in providing information to the community, especially with regard to time

## 6. Suggestions

Based on the research results and conclusions presented, then to improve the performance of employees BKPPD

Ponorogo so that service is implemented can be improved, then suggested a few things, namely:

1. Develop and establish the management of complaints on services performed at BKD Ponorogo, so that complaints can be identified well, acted upon and used the base to enhance the quality of service;
2. Compile and set the standard of competence of Ministry apparatus at BKD Ponorogo, thus increasing the chances for the establishment of service given the task to realize the performance of better service

## References

- Abdullah, M. Ma'ruf. 2014. *Manajemen dan Evaluasi Kinerja Karyawan*. Yogyakarta: Aswaja Pressindo.
- Al-Raisi, Abdulaziz; Amin, Saad; and Tahir, Saad. 2011. Evaluation of e-performance Analysis and Assessment in the United Arab Emirates (UAE) Organizations. *Journal of Internet and Information System*. Vol. 2(2). pp. 20-27.
- Amstrong, Michael. 2008. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo.
- Bastian, Indra. 2006. *Akuntansi Sektor Publik: Suatu Pengantar*. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- Beh, Loo-See. 2014. Public Sector Performance in Malaysia: An Evaluation of Employee Empowerment and Self-Leadership. *Research Journal of Economics, Business and ICT*. Vol. 9. Issue 1. pp. 8-12.
- Chung, Kae E. dan Megginson, Leon C. 2011. *Organization Behavior: Development Managerial*. New York: Hopper Publisher.
- Dharma, Surya. 2011. *Manajemen Kinerja (Falsafah Teori dan Penerapannya)*. Cetakan Keempat. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Dwiyanto, Agus, 2002, *Membangun Sistem Pelayanan Publik Yang Memihak Rakyat*, POPULASI Vol 13 (1), Hal 1-18.
- Dwiyanto, Agus dkk, 2003, *Reformasi Tata Pemerintahan Dan Otonomi Daerah*, PSKK-UGM, Yogyakarta.
- Dwiyanto, Agus dkk, 2006, *Reformasi Birokrasi Publik di Indonesia*, UGM Press, Yogyakarta.
- Dwiyanto Agus, 2008, *Mewujudkan Good Geovernance Melalui Pelayanan Public*. Yogyakarta: UGM Press.
- Fadel, Muhammad. 2009. *Reinventing Local Government: Pengalaman dari Daerah*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- Fahmi, Irham. 2014. *Manajemen Kinerja Teori dan Aplikasi*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Gautami, Rahma. 2013. Kinerja Pegawai Badan Kepegawaian Daerah Kabupaten Nganjuk dalam Melaksanakan Kebijakan Mutasi PNS di Kabupaten Nganjuk. *Kebijakan dan Manajemen Publik*. Vol. 1. No. 1. hlm. 1-7.
- Ginting, Hartika Sari. 2009. Pengaruh Partisipasi Anggaran dan Kejelasan Sasaran Anggaran terhadap Kinerja Aparat Perangkat Daerah di Pemerintahan Kabupaten Karo. *Tesis*. Medan: Sekolah Pascasarjana Universitas Sumatera Utara Medan.
- Halim, Abdul. 2012. *Teori, Konsep, dan Aplikasi Akuntansi Sektor Publik*. Jakarta: Salemba Empat.
- Hasibuan, Malayu P. 2007. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Kim, Soonhee. 2009. A Case Study of Local E-Government Performance in South Korea: Do Leadership and Management for Results Matter? *International Public Management Review*. Vol. 10. Issue 1. pp. 170-199.
- Kusuma, Dirk Malaga. 2013. Kinerja Pegawai Negeri Sipil (PNS) di kantor Badan Kepegawaian Daerah Kabupaten Kutai Timur. *eJournal Administrasi Negara*. Vol. 1. No. 4. hlm. 1388-1400.
- Marwansyah. 2012. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Edisi Kedua. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Moeheriono. 2012. *Indikator Kerja Utama*. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.
- Mohamed, Mirghani S.; O'Sullivan, Kevin J.; and Ribiere, Vincent. 2008. A Paradigm Shift in the Arab Region Knowledge Evolution. *Journal of Knowledge Management*. Vol. 12. No. 5. pp. 107-220.
- Moleong, Lexy J. 2012. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Mondy, R. Wayne. 2008. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Edisi Sepuluh Jilid II. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- Morse, M. Janice dan Denzim, Norman K. 2009. *Membuat Desain Penelitian Kualitatif yang Didanai dalam Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Sage Publication. Penerjemah Dariyatno, dkk. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Musanef. 2004. *Manajemen Kepegawaian di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Gunung Agung.
- Pasolong, Harbani. 2010. *Teori Administrasi Publik*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Pramugi, Sigit; Widowati, Nina; dan Sulandari, Susi. 2013. Analisis Kinerja Badan Kepegawaian Daerah Kota Semarang. *Journal of Public Policy and Management Review*. Vol. 2. No. 4. hlm. 1-9.
- Rakhmat, Jalaluddin. 2009. *Psikologi Komunikasi*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Robbins, Stephen P. 2008. *Perilaku Organisasi*. Jakarta: Indeks.
- Sastrohadiwiryo, Siswanto B. 2010. *Manajemen Tenaga Kerja Indonesia: Pendekatan Administratif dan Operasional*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Siagian, Sondang P. 2011. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Sidanti, Heny. 2015. Pengaruh Lingkungan Kerja, Disiplin Kerja dan Motivasi Kerja terhadap Kinerja Pegawai Negeri Sipil di Sekretariat DPRD Kabupaten Madiun. *Jurnal JIBEKA*. Vol. 9. No. 1. hlm. 44-53.
- Sofyandi, Herman. 2008. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Edisi Pertama. Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu.



- Sologia, Zweetsy. 2013. Kinerja Badan Kepegawaian Daerah dalam Meningkatkan Prestasi Kerja Aparatur Pemerintah Daerah Kota Bitung (Suatu Studi di Badan Kepegawaian Daerah Kota Bitung. *Jurnal Eksekutif*. Vol. 2. No. 1. hlm. 1-21.
- Sugiyono. 2015. *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sutopo, H. B. 2005. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Surakarta: Sebelas Maret University Press.
- Tika, H. Moh Pabundu. 2005. *Budaya Organisasi dan Peningkatan Kinerja Perusahaan*. Cetakan Pertama. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Uno, Hamzah B. dan Lematenggo, Nina. 2012. *Teori Kinerja dan Pengukurannya*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Wahjono, Sentot I.; Perumal, Shamala Devi; Wardhana, Andi; dan Marina, Anna. 2015. Performance Appraisal at Government Owned Company: Evidence From Melaka, Malaysia. *Paper presented at Gadjah Mada International Conference on Economics and Business 2015*. Yogyakarta, Indonesia, 27 November 2015.
- Wibowo. 2010. *Manajemen Kinerja*. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.
- Widjaja, A. W. 2006. *Administrasi Kepegawaian*. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.
- Zvavahera, Promise. 2014. An Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Performance Management Systems on Service Delivery in the Zimbabwean Civil Service. *Journal of Management and Marketing Research*. Vol. 14. No. 1. pp. 1-8.

### **Regulations and legislation**

- Government regulation of the Republic of Indonesia No. 46 Year 2011 about the assessment of the achievements of the work of civil servants.
- Act No. 5 of the year 2014 of the civil State Apparatus.
- Act No. 43 of the year 1999 About Staffing issues.