

Stakeholders Communication Effectiveness on Development Planning Consultation Forum in Banjar City West Java Province of Indonesia

Adhi Iman Sulaiman^{1*}, Djuara P. Lubis², Djoko Susanto², Ninuk Purnaningsih²

1. Faculty of Social and Political Science, University of Jenderal Soedirman, Purwokerto City, Central Java, Indonesia
2. Department Communication of Rural and Agricultural Development, Faculty of Human Ecology, Bogor Agricultural Institute, West Java, Indonesia

Abstract

Demands and challenges in the era of democratization and decentralization have made changes in the development paradigm from centralized development (top down) into participatory development (bottom up) which is more extensive and provides more open opportunities toward society's involvement as well as the aspirations at the local level (grassroots). It is realized through a forum for communication between stakeholders in the development planning consultation forum to formulate the plan, implementation and evaluation development. This study is aimed to analyze stakeholders communication effectiveness in the process and the results of development planning consultation forum in village and urban village. This study used quantitative explanative survey methods with path analysis. Data was collected through questionnaires with sampling gradually began by cluster sampling, Slovin formula and then stratified sampling. The location of study were in sub-district of Banjar and sub-district of Langensari in Banjar West Java Province of Indonesia. The results showed: The characteristic of stakeholders have significant effect 8.05% directly and total effect 17.05% to the communication effectiveness. The stakeholders aspirations either urgent aspiration or aspiration generated in the process of development planning consultation forum at villages/urban villages have significant effect 1.18% directly and total effect 5.59% to the stakeholder communication effectiveness. Media information accessed by the stakeholders have significant effect 5.17% directly and total effect 11.92% to the stakeholders communication effectiveness. The stakeholders communication process have significant effect 19.64% directly and the total effect 28,62% to the stakeholders communication effectiveness. Total effect of exogenous variables and intervening variable of stakeholders communication process, when running simultaneously have significant effect to the stakeholders communication effectiveness about aspects of knowing, trusting and participate in the process and results of development planning consultation forum at villages and urban villages of 63.22%, while 36.72% are affected by other variables which had not been included in the model examined

Keywords: communication effectiveness, stakeholders, consultation forum, development

1. Introduction

The development paradigm is changes in the era of democratization and decentralization from centralized development (top down) into participatory development (bottom up) have provided more open opportunities toward society's involvement as well as the aspirations at the local level starting from the planning, implementing and evaluating in development. It is actualized through the mechanism of development planning consultation as a forum involving development actors, one of which is the stakeholders as the agent of change and communicators development.

The demands and challenges of democratization and decentralization in development are responded with Law No. 25/2004 on National Development Planning, i.e as a complete planning development method to produce development plans over several time frames – long-term, medium-term and annual plans implemented by organizing countries element and communities in central and regional level. This is realized through mechanism of development planning consultation forum to involving development actors ranging from the village, sub-district, district, city, province to national level.

According Nabatchi and Munno (2014) deliberative civic engagement refers to a wide variety of processes through which members of the public, often in concert with policy makers and stakeholders, come together to engage in constructive, informed, and decisive dialogue about important public issues.

The role of stakeholders in development could to support in analyzing: (1) Social phenomenon influenced by decisions or actions; (2) Identifying individuals, groups and organizations that could affect or be affected by a phenomenon. (3) Prioritizing individuals and groups involved in the decision process (Reed et al., 2009). According to Slemp et al. (2012) stakeholder community in the urban and rural areas are the decision makers in local level that determine the growth and quality of life in the region.

The importance role of stakeholders that communicate in the process of development, as stated by Buddenhagen and Baldwin (2011), communication for the development requires development actors that should be involved in the structure that comes from every level of society in the process from planning to implementing the development projects. It becomes very interesting and important to study the stakeholder as actors, communicators and agents of change in the development process. This study is aimed to analyze stakeholders communication effectiveness that focused on the process and results of development planning consultation forum in the village and urban village levels. As stated by Dainty et al. (2006) the effective communication can maintain teamwork and achievement of the team of the process and outcomes such as productivity, profits and mutual opportunities, even can create a comfortable work environment. It should be understood that establishing effective communication is not just about how information transmitted from one person to another, but also on how information interpreted, understood and then followed up.

2. Theoretical Framework

This study is based on a model of communication from Rogers and Shoemaker (1971), namely Source, Messages, Channel, Receiver, Effect (SMCRE), with the following explanation:

- Source, is communicators as main actors with indicator stakeholders characteristics namely age, education background, organization experience, participate experience and motives to attending in development planning consultation forum. Stakeholders in this study were participants of development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban village, both individually as community leaders, religious leaders, traditional leaders, women leaders, youth leaders, as well as representative of the officials and members of the organization such as the community institutions, head of the villages and urban villages, Family Welfare Development Group, cooperatives institution, youth organization, groups of small and medium enterprises, farmer groups, the integrated health service organization, non-governmental organizations (NGOs).
- Message is the important messages that are aspirated by stakeholders and appropriate message with the aspirations that have been proposed in the process and the results of development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages.
- Channel namely media information that is considered important to be accessed and the intensity of the stakeholders accessing media information in the process and results of development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages, such as official invitation letter media from the government of village and urban village, notice board media in office villages, radio, newspapers, billboards and website of the Regional Development Planning Agency.
- Receiver is the recipients of the message in the communication process, an individual or a group that received a message from the source, that is the other stakeholders, facilitators, the regional organization agency, the community, village and urban village government, official and members of the organization in the process of development planning consultation forum, program implementation, monitoring and evaluating the results of development programs in the villages and urban village.
- Effect is the outcome, such as stakeholder communication effectiveness in the process and the results of development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages.

Source, message or aspiration, media information and stakeholder communication processes have been the exogenous variables, while the stakeholder communication effectiveness becomes endogenous variables. The communication effectiveness in this research involves three aspects as shown in table 1.

Table 1. The Aspect of communication effectiveness

According to	Knowing Aspect	Aspects of trust	Aspects of participation
Goldhaber (2003)	the message is received, understood and resubmitted so that there is an exchange of messages	effective communication had messages resources and there was a trustworthy communication activity	the increase of messages, will be able to increase the expectation of individual participation in the communication process
Pace et al. (In Effendy 2005)	called it to secure understanding that ensures communication message is received and understood	describe it as to establish acceptance meaning that the recipient must be directed to trust	states to motivate action that is after understanding and accepting or believing the message has been received, then finally there is activity as an motivated act
Tubbs and Moss (2005)	It could be obtained by knowing the intended meaning, had an understanding that could receive messages carefully, and there was additional information. The effective communication could also be acquired by organizing, presenting and interpreting the information which is obtained	requires a positive psychological atmosphere and full of confidence. If there is distrust in humans relationship, the messages, conveyed even by competent communicators, can have meaning changed and be excommunicated. Trust in effective communication serves to improve relations	it relates to affect attitudes or persuasion which are important in small groups/organizational communications to create consensus and acts as the final process of the stages to facilitate understanding (cognition) what expected, reassuring (affection) and maintain a harmonious relationship
Effendy (2008)	identified as an aspect of cognition which is the process of understanding or knowing and comprehending concerning the mind	referred to it as the aspect of affection concerning the feelings generated by stimulus from the outside	referred to it as the aspect of conation that is psychological aspects related to the effort or struggle. In other word, conation is the attitude of a desire or willingness

3. Statement of the Problem

There are problems in the process and the results of development planning consultation forum from some research result such as Susanti (2009), Ma'rif et al. (2010), Koswara (2010), Satries (2011) and Indrajat et al. (2012), that the development planning consultation forum was still the annual formality, the domination of several stakeholders, thus it provides less opportunity for expressing aspirations, and the effectiveness of the program generated has not yet achieved. The research result of Salahuddin (2012) stating that there are shortage of interactional communication application in terms of communication ability on the role of communicator element, realization precision of the elements of the message (development program) and the accuracy of the intensity of the feedback element.

The results of a preliminary study using descriptive qualitative methods such as: opening access, licensing, and interviewing started on August 2013, then observing, interviewing, and documenting the activities of development planning consultation forum at the village, urban village, district and city of Banjar on January to March 2014 and 2015. As a result, the communication process on implementation of development planning consultation forum at the village and urban village is still dominated by some certain stakeholders, while others are passive stakeholders only approving the agreement. There is still passive facilitator and representative of the Regional Organization Agency to communicate, to give motivation, information and critical data about development plans in the process of consultation forum. The communication has been ineffective yet through socialization and coordination between stakeholders about the program and the proposed format, so there is still unequal format and understanding and in the process of development planning consultation forum in the village, urban villages and sub-districts. The development planning consultation forum results still hasn't satisfy the complete needs of society, due to the dominance of the discussion on infrastructure compared with other fields such as public service of government, social, cultural and economic programs. Based on this, the research is focused on how the stakeholders communication effectiveness in development planning consultation forum at the village and urban village?

4. Objectives of The Study

Based on the theoretical framework and the statement of the problem, the objective of the study is to analyze the exogenous variables that affect the endogenous variables. Exogenous variables are: (1) The source of communication, namely stakeholders as participants of development planning consultation forum in terms of the characteristics of age, formal education, organizational experience, participated experience and motive in attending the development planning consultation forum. (2) The message aspirated is important aspiration and aspirations generated by stakeholders in the development planning consultation forum. (3) Media information, namely the importance of the information media and the intensity media information accessed by stakeholders. (4) The stakeholders communication process in the development planning consultation forum, implementing, monitoring and evaluating the results of development.

Endogenous variables of communication effectiveness includes aspects of knowing, trust and participating in development planning consultation forum. Based on this, the research hypothesis can be formulated that there is significant effect of variables characteristics, aspirations, media information and communication processes toward stakeholder communications effectiveness in the process and the result of development planning consultation forum at the village and urban village.

5. Importance of The Study

This study focuses on development planning consultation forum activities for the preparation of the Local Government Annual Work Program and Budget on the village and urban village levels, due to the planning and the implementing the development results are more focused, in-depth and actual in one year. The stakeholder communication process in development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages, which is more real and factual to struggle for planning, implementing and evaluating the development programs. Development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages become essential foundation in the implementation of participatory and democratic development.

6. The Study Methodology and Procedures

6.1. Research Methods

This study used quantitative methods with explanative survey. Further, this study utilizes statistical to test the hypothesis and analyzes the effect of exogenous variables (X) and intervening variable (Y_1) to endogenous variable (Y_2) with path analysis.

6.2. Research Location

Location of the research: (1) The sub-district Banjar, located in Balokang village and Mekarsari urban village due to the downtown area in Banjar. (2) The sub-district Langensari, located in Rejasari village and Muktisari urban village, as the most eastern entrance gate of the Banjar City directly next to the region of Central Java.

6.3 Data Collection

Data was collected through questionnaires to seek full information about a problem of respondents with interview guide techniques. The data obtained by the questionnaire is the ordinal data scale used for

nonparametric statistical analysis purposes, which should be transformed into interval data or ratio by using Method of Successive Interval (MSI) (Muhidin & Abdurahman 2011).

6.4. Population, Sample and Respondent Determination

The first stage uses cluster sampling with population divided in groups according to area or cluster. Then it determined the two sub-district were chosen each one village and one urban village. The second stage is to determining how many samples, which the number of populations are already known from the stakeholders attendance list as participants of development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages which have been the sites of study. The sample is calculated using the Slovin formula with an error rate of 5%. The third phase, after the number of samples obtained from the overall population, is determining the number of respondents in each study sites that have been determined by taking a stratified sample using proportional random sampling as seen in table 2.

Table 2 Population and Sample

Sub-district	Location of the study	Population	Sample
Banjar	Mekarsari urban village	69 people	46 people
	Balokang village	36 people	24 people
Langensari	Muktisari urban village	44 people	29 people
	Rejasari village	51 people	34 people
sum		200 people	133 people

6.5. Validity and Reliability

Validity testing of the formula product moment and reliability with Cronbach's Alpha method to test the questionnaire on 4-10 August 2014 to 20 respondents namely stakeholders as participants in development planning consultation forum of the Mulyasari village at Pataruman sub-district as one of the locations that is observed directly by the researchers.

6.6. Data Analysis and Hypotheses Testing

Analysis of studies uses path analysis to analyze the effect partially and simultaneously of exogenous variables (X) toward the endogenous variable (Y). Partial hypothesis testing with t_{count} and simultaneous hypothesis testing by calculating F_{count}

7. Results of the Study

Summary direct and indirect effect of stakeholders characteristic variables (X_1), message aspirated variable (X_2), media information accessed variables (X_3) and the communication process variables (Y_1) to stakeholders communication effectiveness (Y_2) that is shown in Table 2, matrix table which adopted from Lumenta et al. (2012)

Table 3 Direct and indirect effect in partial and simultaneous of exogenous variable (X) and intervening variable (Y_1) toward endogenous variable (Y_2)

Variable	Direct effect toward Y_2	indirect effect toward Y_2				Total effect partially toward Y_2
		X_1	X_2	X_3	Y_1	
Characteristics (X_1)	0,0805	-	0,0177	0,0261	0,0456	0,1708
Aspirated messages (X_2)	0,0118	0,0177	-	0,123	0,0142	0,0559
Media accessed (X_3)	0,0517	0,0261	0,123	-	0,0292	0,1192
Communication process (Y_1)	0,1964	0,0456	0,0142	0,0292	-	0,2862
Simultaneous effect of exogenous variable (X) and intervening variable (Y_1) toward endogenous variable (Y_2)						0,6322

7.1. Hypothesis Testing Variable X and Y_1 toward Y_2

7.1.1. Testing Path Corelation Partially

Calculating the statistic test for testing t , with the explanation: where: $i = 1, 2, \dots, k$; k = number of exogenous variables; C_{ii} = inverse correlation matrix; P_{YX_i} = coefficient of path; R_2 = coefficient of determination, $t = t$ distribution, with degrees of freedom $n-k-1$. Testing criteria: Reject H_0 if the value of t is greater than t_{table} ($t_0 > t_{table (n-k-1)}$). By using a 95% confidence level ($\alpha = 0.05$) and the degree of freedom (df) and ($n - k - 1$) obtained t_{table} of 1,980. Calculation test result t with formula it is obtained $t_{calculate}$ X_1 as amounted as 6,00, $t_{calculate}$ X_2 as 2,38, $t_{calculate}$ X_3 as 3,09, and $t_{calculate}$ Y_1 as 7.54.

Thus $t_{calculate}$ X_1 , X_2 , X_3 , and Y_1 are greater than the value t_{table} , so it can be interpreted that stakeholders characteristics variable, the message aspirated, accessible media and communication processes have significant partially effect to stakeholders communication effectiveness in the process and results of the development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban village, meaning that H_0 is rejected and H_a accepted.

7.1.2. Testing Path Coefficient Simultaneously

Using a 95% confidence level ($\alpha = 0.05$) and the degree of freedom (k) and ($n - k$), $df_1 = K - 1 (4 - 1) = 3$ and $df_2 = n - k (133 - 4)$, the obtained F_{table} of 2,68. While the counting results $F_{calculate}$ obtained F_{test} of 55.00. So $F_{calculate} > F_{table}$, and thus the characteristics of stakeholders (X_1), the aspirated message (X_2), accessible media (X_3) and stakeholders communication processes (Y_1) in simultaneously have significant effect toward stakeholders communication effectiveness in the process and results of the development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban village (Y_2), meaning that H_0 is rejected and H_a is accepted.

8. Discussion

8.1. The Effect of Stakeholders Characteristics toward Communication Effectiveness

The results of partial hypothesis test calculations for the characteristics of stakeholders (X_1) have a significant effect toward communication effectiveness (Y_2), namely direct effect of 8.05%, and the indirect effect through its relationship with message aspirated 1.77%, accessible media of 2.61% and 4.65% of the communication process as well as the total effect of variables X_1 toward Y_2 17.08%.

Thus it can analyzed the differences in the characteristics of stakeholders in terms of age, education background, organization experience, participate experience and motives to attending in development planning consultation forum, it will determine the effect directly and simultaneously toward communication effectiveness concerning aspects of knowing (cognitive), trust (affective), and participatory (conative) in the process and results of the development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages.

According to Reinwald and Kraemmergaard (2012), the stakeholder involvement is very important in the process of achieving transformational government. The importance of stakeholder analysis, according to Reed et al. (2009), is to define aspects of social phenomena affected by the decision or participation, identification of individuals, groups and organizations involved in the decision-making process.

Therefore, the characteristics of stakeholders is important to concern: (1) to provide more opportunity, motivation and empowerment for representation of stakeholders, who are still a few in development planning consultation forum at the villages and urban village such as women, who have high education and other professions (other than farmers and traders) as well as the younger generation. According to Slempt et al. (2012) there was representation from various stakeholders community in both urban and rural areas which are very important as the decision makers at the local level composed of professionals, educators, representatives of businessman and agricultural producers that determine the growth and quality of life in the region.

Effective communication factors, according Mberia (2011) one of which are the willing to listen, and responding with an open mind, acknowledging and appreciating the cultural and gender differences in communication. While according to Adams (2014) to achieve consensus (discussion) requires not only agreeing on arguments that are considered valid and acceptable, but also increasing tolerance for different viewpoints (conflicting) involving discussion participants in changing their view on aspiration or arguments which are agreed as a result of discussion.

(2) Conducting socialization, training, and assistance on the identification and analysis techniques in designing the proposed development program, implementing, reporting and evaluating the development outcomes. This activity is organized by the Regional Development Planning Agency in cooperation with universities such as the study center of community empowerment and the Institute for Research and Community Service.

According to Shade et al. (2012) empowerment is a process of increasing capacity of individuals or groups to make effective choices and interpreted the choices into action and desired outcomes. Together with a participation that has the opportunity to be involved in the decision-making process and empowerment is an important dimension of human development. According to Atkin and Skitmore (2008) this requires stakeholder management to identify: (a) contextual program factors, (b) perceptions or views factors, (c) empowerment factor and (d) the relationship as a factor in determining the success of program activities.

(3) The stakeholders is not only represents of the communities and organizations, but the stakeholders is the opinion leaders in the process and results of the development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages. The opinion leader has advantages in terms of knowledge, concept, motivation, awareness, social responsibility, and also to able access the media information and deliver to accordance with the knowledge and needs of the community. According to Badri et al. (2008) a person who is considered the public figure or leaders by communities, because it has the capability of empathy and greater social participation, that real impact the figure or leader of social services. The importance of role opinion leaders, according to Hedley Tah (2014) the opinion leaders can be speak to change the attitudes and behavior of others and able to aspirations on behalf of people, who give their opinions and were agreed.

8.2. The Effect of Stakeholders Aspiration toward Communication Effectiveness

Stakeholders aspirations (X_2) with the indicator of important aspiration and aspiration resulting in development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages based on the results of partial hypothesis calculation test have significant effect toward communication effectiveness (Y_2), ie 1.18% direct effect, indirect

effect through relation to the characteristics of the stakeholders of 1.77%, accessible media of 1.23% and 1.42% of the communication process, as well as the total effect of X_2 toward Y_2 of 5.59%.

Aspiration of the stakeholders is an important aspiration and in accordance with the proposal, namely: (1) the message conveyed is the participatory aspiration of the people and organizations (bottom up). (2) Aspiration based on the program which has not been carried out and the priorities on the program which should be precedence.

(3) Aspiration in accordance with the budget and the results of the development planning consultation forum on Citizens Association in sub-village. (4) Refusing proposals which do not accord to the needs of society and that only favors certain groups. (5) Aspiration development program proposed is not only dominant in the field of infrastructure, but pay attention to other development programs, namely: the field of governance, social, cultural and economic. (6) Aspiration should be based on the identification of the problem, the potential and prospects of natural resources, human resources and economic resources of society. Therefore the proposed program is not aimed to budget allocation.

According to Knobloch et al. (2013) in analyzing, the deliberation involves four steps: (1) Creating a solid base information, (2) Identify and prioritize key values, (3) Identify the various solutions, and (4) considering the pros and cons of the decision.

Aspirations of stakeholders are on four areas. The first area is infrastructure development beside the facilitating road access for vehicles, construction and maintenance of irrigation to fisheries and rainfed, improving the structure of traditional markets and health care facilities such as clinics and public health center (Puskesmas) in villages or urban villages. Second area is government such as increasing capacity and competency of service, as well as the welfare of neighbor and Citizens Association in sub-village. Third area is social and cultural sector as improving the culture and awareness of environmental hygiene and the health of children and families, religious activities (spirituality), and preservation of art and local culture. Fourth area is economy such as capital improvements and competence, mentoring and partnerships for small and medium businesses, agriculture, and fisheries.

The fourth program can be aspirated based on to improve human resources in order to develop the productivity of natural resources and the economy there. This is referred to as the concept of people-centered development (Adi 2013) as an effort to improve people's lives by focusing on sustainable empowering people.

Messages or information submitted by communicators are considered effective if there are the ability to create a message that will be understood easily, having credibility of the recipient, and obtaining an optimal feedback on the effect of the message in the communicant (Siburian 2013). According to Robertson and Choi (2012) the nature of participation in the consultation forum is to openly share knowledge and information, all opinions are considered equally important and participants consider all of the information available before making a decision.

8.3. The Effect of Media Information toward Communication Effectiveness

The calculations results of partial hypothesis test media information (X_3) has a significant effect toward communication effectiveness (Y_2), ie direct effect of 5.17%, effect through relationships with stakeholders characteristic of 2.61%, message aspirated 1.23%, the communication process 2.92%, and the total effect variable X_3 toward Y_2 11.92%.

The effect of media information accessed toward communication effectiveness are the intended namely: (1) Media information accessed in the form an official letter of invitation, agenda, format and program proposals are given well prepared to stakeholders. (2) Utilizing and increasing the quantity of media information accessed such as notice boards which are available in the office of the villages and urban villages to disseminate the results of the agenda and the implementation of the development planning consultation forum, so widely known by society which are not involved directly. (3) The development planning consultation forum can make use of the media information such as radio, newspapers, and billboards to publish the agenda and the results, so that are known by the public (public) and could be a media control for the results implementation development program. (4) Designing and optimizing the availability of the Regional Development Planning Agency website for data input, control and evaluate the results programs of the development planning consultation forum with the ease of access to the internet network as the implementation of the Electronic Government (e-Gov) and good governance concept which has participatory, transparent and accountable characteristics to public. According to Pfister and Godana (2012) citizens have always used new communication tools to persuade toward different ends.

Communication media is a tool supports integrate different communication channels which are: (1) the conventional mass media such as journals, brochures, books, manuals; (2) Media interpersonal such as discussions, group meetings, and (3) a hybrid media such as the Internet (Leewis 2006). According Batta et al. (2014) mass communication media, including cyberspace and other traditional communication channels, have important role in creating awareness of science and technology (through the dissemination of facts, data, and images) in any form, media shares to public audiences it have problems and challenges potentially.

Based on the preliminary draft of the National Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMN,) from 2015 to 2019 in the national development agenda to creat transparency and performance accountability of government, has the

policy and strategy, namely: (1) Application of open government as an attempt to support the establishment of governance that is open, participatory and accountable in the formulation of public policy, as well as control of the implementation of state and government. (2) The implementation of e-government to support the business processes of government and the development of a simple, efficient and transparent and integrated.

According to Ciortercu and Anechitoaie (2012) the increase of communication through information access, transparency of finance and administration, has increased the level of certainty and justice. This is in order to implementation of development planning consultation forum to be more participative, transparent and accountable, as according to Van Der Waldt (2014) the ability to provide and perform data access services through the e-government (e-Gov) in the framework of accountability, participation, predictability, and transparency, are the four basic elements of Good Governance.

The importance of supporting factors towards national development, according to research Age et al. (2012) is to achieve development goals by remark the process of development, start from the bottom or grassroots level that is implementing agricultural and rural development in the right place on a large scale. One of the major steps in this perspective is to conduct on human resource development through the use of appropriate channels of mass media. As long as there is an imbalance in the spread and misdirected information, then the national development goal hasn't achieved and still become problematic to be able to empower the potential of rural communities.

8.4. The Effect of Communication Process toward Communication Effectiveness

The calculation results of partial hypothesis test for the stakeholders communication process (Y_1) has a significant effect toward communication effectiveness (Y_2) that is direct effect amounted to 19.64%, through the effect of the relationship with the stakeholder characteristics of 4.56%, messaging aspirated 1,42%, the media accessed by stakeholders 2.92%, and the total effect of Y_1 toward Y_2 amounted to 28.62%.

The stakeholders communication process to occurs exchange of opinions, negotiations, conflict of interest, generate decisions and cooperation. According to Bostrom and Hallstrom (2013) The collect ideas of stakeholders as actors from diverse social environment in the process of establishing a rule that combined the resources, competencies, and experience. This process also allows no competing interests to negotiate and deliberation that takes into account political issues and global ethics. In addition, the diverse stakeholders can generate cooperation in the composition and arrangement of stakeholders, then increasing respect, understanding, learning, and trust between stakeholders

The effect of communication process toward communication effectiveness can be conducted by: (1) Carrying out stages of discussion sessions in each of the four groups of development program field, which participants have been determined. The next stage of plenary discussion session is to presented the results to be known by all participants. (2) Improving the competence of facilitators who moderated in development planning consultation forum with the recruitment process, open selection based on educational qualifications and experience to serve the community through written tests and interviews, then the next stage of training for facilitators. (3) The role and Regional Organizational Agency should be improved in the process of development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages, that is active communication with stakeholders such as knowing and explaining the data on the Local Government Annual Work Program and Budget, especially with regard to the priorities proposed in four field development program such as the field of infrastructure, public service, social cultural, economic in community. (4) Consultation forum is not only in the development planning process, but also the village and urban village governments can create other forums, both formal and informal with stakeholders and community in the results of implementation, control and evaluation of development outcomes. (5) Stakeholders at the community institutions such as Citizens Association, chief of village, urban village and public organization, should disseminate the results, implementation and evaluation from the outcome of the development planning consultation forum in villages and urban villages.

Communication can serves to explanation of the various modes of local people who use the communication among them and to make their meaning on the experience, residence, history, identity, resources, and involvement in a global world (Porrás & Steeves 2009). According Orzeata (2013) the importance of verbal communication directly and in writing, it gives the opportunity to convey explicit messages about the objectives, interests, ways and means of communicating as a competition to promote the interests and means of negotiations with third parties.

According to Nwosu and Duru (2011) who conducted a study of communication for the implementation of good governance and accountability, the results are: (1) Communication contribute very decisive and affect implements to good governance (good governance), especially in the regions. (2) Stakeholder ability in communicating can increase the support in achieving the goals of government reform, affect opinions, attitudes and behavior change towards more emphasis on participatory and deliberative process.

8.5. Simultaneous effect variables X and Y₁ toward Communication Effectiveness

The effect of exogenous variable such as characteristics, aspirations, media information accessed and the communication process in simultaneously have significant effect toward stakeholder communication effectiveness concerning aspects of knowing (cognitive), trust (affective), and participatory (conative) in the process and results of the development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages amounting to 63.22%, while 36.72% is influenced by other variables which are not examined.

Things to consider in improving the factors that affect toward communication effectiveness in the process and results of the development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages are: (1) The importance of knowing aspects (cognitive) to create socialization in writing, so that stakeholders informed the development planning activities, implementation and evaluation of results. It is supported by the availability of supply and media access provided to information such as through a formal letter, media notice board in the office of the village and urban villages, utilization of radio and local newspapers and websites of Regional Development Planning Agency. According Sedereviciute and Valentini (2011) actors closer to other people through direct contact or indirect contact, in the context of social media, can be a good facilitator of the flow information within the network or insight provider into the latest social media agenda.

It is important to disseminate stakeholders through formal and informal meetings on the agenda, the mechanisms, the proposed format, program plan and budget, the proposed development, as well as the distribution of the four groups in the fields of development program. According to Hedley Tah (2014) communicators can change the attitudes and behavior of other people and can speak on behalf of people, who give an opinion or agreed with. (2) The importance of trust aspects (affective) that have confidence in the process, outcome and implementation of the development program is the result of a shared commitment and a shared responsibility. Aspects of the trust will continue become social capital for stakeholders as representation of the community, who can to struggle and satisfy community needs. According to Beard (2007) in general, rural areas have characteristics that are expected to be more supportive relationship based on mutual trust, relationships that are fundamental to social capital and ultimately can facilitate collective action in the community.

Deliberative communication will not be qualified nor meaningful if there is no mutual trust, loss of motivation, uninvolved parties, lack of communication skills to aspire, do not know and understand the problems faced (Mannarini 2011). When participants do not trust one another, loose motivation, feel apart from the group, or do not have the communication skills, arguments, and cognitive, it will affect the quality of the discussions. Factors knowing and trust are a continuous process experienced in the communication process as a communication in development planning consultation forum ranging from the sub-village level and village or urban village to the sub-district levels. The importance of having confidence in the process and the outcome will result in a shared commitment to shared responsibility (Nkwe 2012). (3) Stakeholders not only can participate actively in the process of formulation of the proposed development program in development planning consultation forum, but also can enhance the participatory aspect (conative) with a more active role in the socialization process and the results of development planning consultation forum to the community, then to provide guidance to the implementation, and development evaluation.

A shared commitment as a result of an agreement through discussion process that has a regulation to guide the community and shared political interests. Regulation that they choose will affect how social institutions can distribute basic rights and basic tasks in society. Regulations agreed will be able to guide the distribution of benefits of social cooperation (Nbeta 2012). Development planning consultation forum should be able to generate a list of priority needs of the community, not just the wishes of the people with adjusted funds available. Community parties (bottom up) must be more active in the implementation of development planning consultation forum and dig as many information as possible about the program related to their respective areas. Inactivity community will reduce the proposed and aspirated programs. According to Barker (2013) communication is a strategic and integrated interactive processes, in which the messages created and shared through knowledge management information to build mutual understanding and profitable relationship between the organization and stakeholders, through the integrated use of traditional and new media.

9. Conclusion

The Stakeholder characteristics have significant partially direct effect of 8.05% and 17.05% total effect toward communication effectiveness (Y₂) in development planning consultation forum in the village and urban village. Thus differences in the characteristics of stakeholders in terms of age, education background, organization experience, participate experience and motives to attending in development planning consultation forum, it will determine the effect directly and simultaneously toward communication effectiveness concerning aspects of knowing (cognitive), trust (affective), and participatory (conative) in the process and results of the development planning consultation forum in the villages and urban villages

The stakeholders aspiration has a direct effect 1.18% and 5.59% total effect toward communication effectiveness. The stakeholders have important aspiration and aspiration proposed which are generated in in

development planning consultation forum in the village and urban village based on the needs of the community, organization, and development programs that become important and urgent priorities.

The accessible media information, has a direct effect 5.17% and 11.92% total effect toward communication effectiveness. Media information is the importance of information access to the media and the intensity of the media accessed by stakeholders through the notice board in the office of the villages or urban villages, billboards, newspapers and local radio and website of Regional Development Planning Agency. The information media useful to socialize the activities and the implementation result of development planning consultation forum, and become to media control and support for development programs evaluation. The stakeholder communication process, has a direct effect 19.64% and 28.62% total effect. Communication process in question is on the activities before, during and after the development planning consultation forum in the village and urban village.

The variables that has the most affect toward stakeholders communication effectiveness partially in the process and the results of development planning consultation forum in the village and urban village, namely The First, stakeholder communication process. Second, stakeholder characteristic. Third, accessible media information. Fourth, the stakeholders aspiration.

The Variables of characteristics, aspirations, accessible media information and communication processes in simultaneously have a significant effect toward stakeholder communication effectiveness concerning aspects of knowing, believing and participating in the process and the results of development planning consultation forum at the villages and urban villages mounting to 63.22% , while 36.78% is effect by other variables which are not examined.

The communication effectiveness referred to development planning consultation forum in the village and urban village that have three aspects: (1) aspects of knowing (cognitive), about the information of official invitation, agenda and program proposals. The division of the group discussions on four areas of development, socialization of objectives of the activity, processes and results of development planning consultation forum. (2) Aspects of trust (affective), the purpose, benefits, and results of development planning consultation forum, the role of the facilitator, as well as Regional Organizational Agency. (3) Partisipative aspects (conative), namely actively proposed of development planning consultation forum in sub-village areas based on the aspirations of the people, organizations, and programs that have not been fulfilled and actively implementing, monitoring and evaluating the results of development planning consultation forum villages and urban villages.

10. Recommendation

1. The characteristic effect toward communication effectiveness should be: (a) Provide the opportunity, motivation and empowerment for stakeholders from women's representation, among the highly educated and other professions as well as the younger generation that haven't much attended in consultation forum. (b) Conduct socialization, training, and assistance for the identification and analysis techniques in designing the proposed development program, implementing, reporting and evaluating of development outcomes. This activity is organized by the Regional Development Planning Agency in cooperation with universities such as the study center of community empowerment and the Institute for Research and Community Service.
2. Aspiration should be based on the identification of problems, potential and prospects to resources of human, natural, and economic, so that the proposed program is not just for the realization of the existing allocation of funds. The strategy is Regional Development Planning Agency must be organizing information dissemination, training and mentoring in cooperation with the universities to stakeholders and community in the village or urban village of strategy in the planning, implementing, reporting and evaluating the development as a result of development planning consultation forum in villages and urban villages.
3. The Strategy to utilization and increase of media information to support the communication effectiveness in the process and the implementation results of development planning consultation forum in villages and urban villages. It is through the media notice board at the village and urban village office, radio and local newspapers as well as website of Regional Development Planning Agency. This is implementation of the good governance concept which involve all stakeholders to participation, public disclosure and budget transparency and could be accountable to the public.
4. Improving the communication process to support the communication effectiveness in development planning consultation forum in villages and urban villages, that stakeholders do not only communicate in the process of development planning, but also in the implementation, monitoring and evaluation of development outcomes. Stakeholders should be able to have knowing aspects, trust and participation in the process and implementing the results with the socialization and organizing training by Development Planning Agency.
5. The communication effectiveness in the process and the results of development planning consultation forum villages and urban villages must meet three aspects, namely: (a) Aspects of knowing (cognitive) about information the agenda of activities, results and implementation, supported by a process of socialization through dialogical meeting forums and availability, utilization and the ability to access the public information media. (b) Aspects of trust (affective), must be maintained as an important social capital in the process and the results of development planning consultation forum, as a shared commitment among the public, stakeholders and local

government to be able responsibility for development collectively. (c) Aspects of participation (conative), that stakeholders not only active in the formulation process of the proposed development program in consultation forum, but also actively participate in the process socialization of the results, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of development outcomes.

Acknowledgements

This article is one of the results of the dissertation research sponsored by the Graduate Education Scholarship from the Directorate General of Higher Education (Dikti) or the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education. We are grateful for the support to Directorate General of Higher Education (Dikti), University of Jenderal Soedirman, the supervising commission, Graduate school of Bogor Agricultural Institute. Hopefully the results of this study can be useful for the development of science, stakeholders and local government in making public policy for welfare communities.

References

- Adams, B.E. (2014). Reason-Giving In Deliberative Forums. *Journal of Public Deliberation*. Vol. 10 (6), 1-27
- Adi, I.R. (2013). *Intervensi Komunitas dan Pengembangan Masyarakat sebagai Upaya Pemberdayaan Masyarakat*. Jakarta (ID): RajaGrafindo Persada
- Age, A.I., Obinne, C.P.O., & Demenongu, T.S. (2012). Communication for Sustainable Rural and Agricultural Development in Benue State, Nigeria. *Sustainable Agriculture Research*. Vol. 1 (1), 118-129
- Atkin, B., & Skitmore, M. (2008). Editorial: stakeholder management in construction. *Construction Management and Economics*. 26, 549–552
- Badri, M., Hubeis, M., & Maksum. (2008). Pemberdayaan Komunikasi Pemuka Pendapat dalam Penanganan Bencana Gempa Bumi Di Yogyakarta (Kasus Kabupaten Bantul). *Jurnal Komunikasi Pembangunan*. Vol 6 (1): 55-71
- Barker, R. (2013). Strategic integrated communication: An alternative perspective of integrated marketing communication?. *Communicatio: South African Journal for Communication Theory and Research*. Vol 39 (1),102–121
- Batta, H., Ashong, C., & Obot, C. (2014). Science, Nano-Science and Nano-Technology Content in Nigeria's Elite and Popular Press: Focus on Framing and Socio-political Involvement. *New Media and Mass Communication*. Vol.3 (1),9-20
- Beard, V.A. (2007). Household Contributions to Community Development in Indonesia. *World Development*. Vol. 35 (4), 607–625,
- Bastrom, M., & Hallstrom, K.T. (2013). Global multi-stakeholder standard setters: how fragile are they?. *Journal of Global Ethics*.Vol. 9, No. 1: 93–110
- Buddenhagen, R.W., & Baldwin, J.R. (2011). Performing communicative functions in development projects: An exploratory study of development practices in Tanzania. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*. 36 (3),418–429.
- Ciortescu, C.G., & Anechitoaie, C. (2012). Effective Systems of Data Communication in International Trade. *International Journal of Communication Research*. volume 2,(3):198-201
- Dainty, A., Moore, D., & Murayy, M. (2006). *Communication in Construction : Theory and Practice*. London (GB), New York (US): Taylor and Francis
- Effendy, O.U. (2008). *Dinamika Komunikasi*. Bandung : Rosdakarya
- Effendy, O.U. (2005). *Ilmu Komunikasi: Teori dan Praktek*. Bandung : Rosdakarya
- Goldhaber, G.M. (2003). *Organizational Communication*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Hedley Tah, T. (2014). Participation for Political Development in Cameroon. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. Vol. 4 (7), 150-153
- Indrajat, H., Hardjo, B., Hadi, I., & Budiono, P. (2012). Partisipasi Masyarakat dalam Proses Pembangunan di Kecamatan Kemiling. *Seminar Hasil-Hasil Penelitian dan Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat-Dies Natalis FISIP Unila*,32 - 45
- Knobloch, K.R., Gastil, J., Reedy, J., & Walsh, K.C. (2013). Did They Deliberate? Applying an Evaluative Model of Democratic Deliberation to the Oregon Citizens' Initiative Review. *Journal of Applied Communication Research*. Vol. 41, No. 2: 105-125

- Koswara. (2010). Strategi Penyeragaman Penyusunan APBD dengan RPJMD Untuk Meningkatkan Pembangunan Sarana dan Prasarana di Kota Bekasi. *Tesis*. Bogor : Institut Pertanian Bogor
- Leeuwis, C. 2006. *Communication for Rural Innovation : Rethinking Agricultural Extension* : with contributions from Anne van den Ban. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd
- Lumenta, C., Kekenusa, J.S., & Hatidja, D. (2012). Analisis Jalur Faktor-Faktor Penyebab Kriminalitas di Kota Manado. *Jurnal Ilmiah Sains*. Vol 12 (2),77-83
- Ma'rif, S., Nugroho, P., & Wijayanti, L. (2010). Evaluasi Efektivitas Pelaksanaan Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan (Musrenbang) Kota Semarang. *Riptek*. Vol.4 (11), 53-62
- Mannarini, T. (2011). Public involvement and competent communities: Towards a social psychology of public participation. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. Vol. 1 (7), 66-72
- Mberia, H.K. (2011). Communication Training Module: The Special Issue on Contemporary Research in Social Science. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. Vol. 1 (20), 231-255
- Muhidin, S.A, & Abdurahman, M. (2011). *Analisis Korelasi, Regresi, dan Analisis Jalur dalam Penelitian*. Bandung: Pustaka Setia
- Nabatchi, T., & Munno, G. (2014). Deliberative Civic Engagement: Connecting Public Voices to Public Governance. In P. Levine and K. Soltan (eds.), *Civic Studies*, 49-58
- Nbete, A.D. (2012). The Social Contract Theory: A Model for Reconstructing a True Nigerian Nation-State. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. Vol. 2 (15), 267-278
- Nkwe, N. (2012). E-Government: Challenges and Opportunities in Botswana. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. Vol. 2 (17), 39-48
- Nwosu, J., & Duru, H.C. (2011). Communication for Good Governance and Accountability Programme. *Journal of Communication*. 2 (1), 210-221
- Orzeata, M. (2013). Defective Communication and The Lack of Communication-Main Causes of Security Crises Between Communities Belonging to Different Cultures. *International Journal of Communication Research*. Vol 3 (2), 100-109
- Pfister, D.S., & Godana, G.D. (2012). Deliberation Technology. *Journal of Public Deliberation*. Vol 8 (1),1-7
- Porras, L.E., & Steeves, H.L. (2009). Feminism in a Post-Development Age. Di dalam: McPhail, Thomas L, editor. *Development Communication: Reframing The Role of The Media*. Malden, Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd
- Reed, M.S., Graves, A., Dandy, N., Posthumus, H., Hubacek, K., Morris, J., Prell, C., Quinn, C.H., & Stringer, L.C. (2009). Who's in and why? A typology of stakeholder analysis methods for natural resource management. *Journal of Environmental Management*. 90,1933-1949
- Reinwald, A., & Kraemmergaard, P. (2012). Managing stakeholders in transformational government - A case study in a Danish local government. *Government Information Quarterly*. GOVIN-00813:1-9
- Robertson, P.J., & Choi, T. (2012). Deliberation, Consensus, and Stakeholder Satisfaction : A simulation of collaborative Governance. *Public Management Review*. Vol. 14 (1), 83-103
- Rogers, E.M., & Shoemaker, F.F. (1971). *Communication of Innovations : A Cross Cultural Approach*. New York: The Free Press
- Salahuddin. (2012). Pengaruh Komunikasi Interaksional Terhadap Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan Di Kota Kendari. *Jurnal Stimuli Ilmu Komunikasi*. 3, 70-78
- Satries, W.I. (2011). Mengukur Tingkat Partisipasi Masyarakat Kota Bekasi dalam Penyusunan APBD Melalui Pelaksanaan Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan (Musrenbang) 2010. *Jurnal Kybernan*. Vol. 2 (2), 89-130
- Sedereviciute, K., & Valentini, C. (2011). Towards a More Holistic Stakeholder Analysis Approach. Mapping Known and Undiscovered Stakeholders from Social Media. *International Journal of Strategic Communication*. 5, 221-239
- Shade, O.K., Awodele, O., & Samuel, O.O. (2012). ICT: An Effective Tool in Human Development. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. Vol. 2 (7),157-162
- Sibirian, T.A. (2013). The Effect of Interpersonal Communication, Organizational Culture, Job Satisfaction, and Achievement Motivation to Organizational Commitment of State High School Teacher in the District

- Humbang Hasundutan, North Sumatera, Indonesia. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. Vol. 3(12), 247-264
- Slemp, C., Davenport, M.A., Seekamp, E., Brehm, J.M, Schoonover, J.E, & Williard, K.W.J. (2012). Growing too fast: Local stakeholders speak out about growth and its consequences for community well-being in the urban–rural interface. *Landscape and Urban Planning* , 1-10
- Susanti. (2009). Pengaruh Partisipasi Masyarakat terhadap Proses Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan di Kecamatan Kapuas Kabupaten Sanggau. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi*. 3, 293-305
- Tubbs, S.L., & Moss, S. (2005). *Human Communication: Konteks-Konteks Komunikasi*. Mulyana D, (ed). Bandung : Rosdakarya
- Undang-Undang No. 25 tahun 2014 tentang Sistem Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional
- Van Der Waldt, G. (2014). Towards the Construction of Knowledge in Public Governance as Field of Scientific Enquiry. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. Vol. 4 No. 3: 67-80